RESEARCH NOTE

NOTE DE RECHERCHE

A Canadian Girl at Cheltenham:
The Diary as an Historical Source

Johanna Selles-Roney

In recent years the diary has been reclaimed as an important source for feminist history.⁰ As one manifestation of the autobiographical mode, or narrative form, the diary can offer the reader insight into the individual lives of people who were not necessarily well known but whose experiences can enrich our understanding of a place and a period in history. The unique advantage of the diary as a historical source is that it deals with both the personal life, and the life of the everyday. It can also reflect the changing experiences of the life cycle. The intent of the diarist is generally private; the information in the diary originates from an immanent perspective, following a linear dateline. In educational history, diaries of teachers or students provide a ground-level view of school life which official educational reports or census figures can never recreate.

The use of diaries presents some difficulties as well.² For young girls, diaries were often an exercise in handwriting or composition open to public scrutiny by parents; in such cases, the degree of self-revelation in a diary may be limited. On the other hand, the spiritual diary might have been intended as an entirely personal document. Whichever the case, the historian must think about the implications of the diary's purposes. Finally, the omniscient perspective of the diarist can prove to be an obstacle to the historian. Details are assumed or considered self-evident and the historian is faced with the challenge of reconstructing chronology or facts which the diarist left out.

Despite these difficulties, diaries remain a central source in understanding the histories of women and hence, women's history. An illustration is provided by the diaries of Mabel Cartwright, a woman who played an important role in Ontario education in the first few decades of the twentieth century.³ Born in 1869, Cartwright grew up in Toronto, and was sent at age sixteen to Cheltenham College in England. Afterwards she studied at Lady Margaret Hall, Oxford, did some social work in east-end London, and later taught at the Oxford High School. Once again in Toronto, she taught at Bishop Strachan School for three years prior
to her appointment as Principal of St. Hilda’s, the Anglican Women’s residence of Trinity College, University of Toronto, a position she held from 1903 to 1936. Cartwright became a lecturer in English at Trinity College in 1912, and Associate Professor in 1928. In addition to her role at St. Hilda’s, she was an active member of the University Women’s Club and the Anglican Women’s Auxiliary.

The diaries, consisting of two notebooks Mabel Cartwright kept while a student at Cheltenham, reveal some of the formative influences which helped shape this influential woman, but they also tell us a great deal about the experience of attending an important boarding school that attracted many girls from the British colonies. More importantly, they provide evidence of the vital religious motivation that was behind Cartwright’s quest for advanced learning, a motivation, we are beginning to understand, that was at the centre of the quest for many other women of her time. As Margaret Bryant notes: “With few exceptions these women in all their diversity of belief and personality were sustained by religious faith and practice.” Further, she argues, “We shall never understand these women and their cause if we do not see it in this way, for it was the dimension in which their lives had validity or reality, and in which the age wished to articulate its experiences and aspirations.” The religious aspect of schooling, in other words, was not a matter of individual experience or a particular school. Schooling was a vocation, a religious mission which earned young graduates from schools such as Cheltenham took to many corners of the world.

On the one hand, then, a diary can tell us about individual lives as such—about how individuals interpreted their experiences, or how the continuities of an individual’s life can be preserved even as transitions in the life cycle take place. Mabel’s diaries, for example, give us a vivid insight into the ambivalent feelings that must have accompanied such a major adventure in a young girl’s life as the transition from home and family to the alien world of an English boarding school. On August 6, 1885, Mabel confided in her diary mixed emotions about her imminent departure for England:

I can’t help thinking of England.... we shall leave at the end of the month (D.V.) to go to Cheltenham, which seems preferable to an ordinary boarding school, Uncle John is taking us over, but as to leaving, I simply don’t know how I shall get through and feel almost wild when I think of it.

One could speculate that a sibling or a chaperone accompanied Cartwright, but one cannot be certain.

Her first impressions of the Cheltenham Ladies’ College, in any case, provide us with a vivid portrait of the institution and of the Lady Principal, Miss Beale. She wrote:

We then sallied out to the Ladies College, a building so Church-like that I can hardly yet realize that it is anything but a conservative edifice.
Miss Beale, at home for a day or 2, took us over to the College, delightful classrooms and 2 exquisite coloured windows presented by an artist friend....I pictured Miss Beale tall and rather thin, very stiff at 1st, with a very large chin and forehead and piercing eyes, whereas she is rather short, stout, gray-haired with kindly eyes and most pleasant....Cheltenham as far as we can see, is a pretty place, trees planted all along the streets and a hill in the background.

The academic year was marked by holidays which were spent with relatives or friends at home or abroad. Leisure time, walks, friends, and novel-reading were important components of the school experience. In addition, church and church-related activities filled a large portion of many students' lives. In schools where various denominational backgrounds attended, the reflections on sameness or difference recorded in the diary gives an important insight into the creation of identity and the formation of allegiances within the larger identity of school. Cartwright's diary contains references to various elements described above, such as sermons, novels, holidays, friends, and travels. Her entries over the Christmas period which she spent in Oxford in 1885 give this daily flavour:

Dec. 23. I went to Evensong at 8:15. Such a fine sermon on St. Paul as a warrior: "Put on the whole armour of God."

Xmas Eve. Very melancholy all day. Went to Oxford St. in the morning and bought a little Keats for M. a thick yellow fog part of the time—went to Evensong at 5:30 and heard the beautiful Isai: lx. Finished the Last of the Mohicans in the evening wh. made me feel sadder. Uncas is a perfect delight. Grand isn't he?

Xmas Day. Went to the Holy Feast at 8 A.M. and felt nearer home. A beautiful 4 o'clock service—our "Adeste Fideles." Canadian mail in when I got home. Ten for me and I think as many cards.

Dec. 27. Dense fog in the morning. Read Wenzel's Inheritance. I know few Stories so inspiring as that book! The devilish devices to shake the faith of Wenzel and Bernhard and the love for Christ proving stronger than all earthly anguish or rather, the divine strength thus perfected in human weakness, and that glorious scene by the precipice where Wenzel wins by the might of the Spirit.

In these initial excerpts from Cartwright's diary, one senses her enthusiasm for college life at Cheltenham. Her impressions confirm what we know from historical studies such as Josephine Kamm's, yet lend an individual perspective to the school experience.
What types of information are not included in Cartwright’s diary? She does not speak of the elite nature of the school and whether she perceived it to be an honour to be admitted. Her reference to the fact that Cheltenham would be better than an “ordinary” boarding school begs the question “how would it be better?”, but the diary remains silent. If the academic level of the college did not pose a problem, this suggests that Cartwright’s Canadian schooling prepared her adequately for Cheltenham. But how did she interpret her educational preparation prior to Cheltenham? Cartwright’s schooling in Canada consisted of a combination of home study, instruction by governesses, and participation in small groups of girls who studied together and took exams. One fact which is clear is that Cartwright’s brothers followed a very different and more formal educational path, as boarding students at Trinity College School, Port Hope, and Royal Military College, Kingston.

The diary can be a source of information on significant relationships in the diarist’s life, both within and outside of the school community. Cartwright’s diary shows how she initially viewed her classmates and how her opinion changed over time. Once again, a diary can illuminate the transitions in an individual life, providing a more detailed vision of reality within the continuity of the years at school. She was at first disappointed by her classmates. She liked “Mary Harvey and Florrie Barker best of the girls here—but I am most disappointed in the girls. I expected to find Mrs. Adams here, girls it would be a pleasure to have as friends but such is not the case. My Canadian friends are much nicer.” This initial alienation diminished over time as Cartwright did eventually make new friends. Often it was the trials of school-days that forged new bonds. One such trial was the sudden death of a classmate. Cartwright described how her classmates sat huddled in the study waiting to hear the prognosis, only to find out the next morning that Mary had died. She described the sad event:

The girls were all so nice—5 of them have gone to St. Hilda’s and 5 more to Mrs. Brady’s and 2 to Miss Chute’s; so only 9 of us are left. We are sleeping 3 in a room—Agnes is with us—I can hardly realize that we shall never again see Mary coming in with that old black bag under her arm. She is happy now and knows all things. She was to have been confirmed this month and now her confirmation is in Heaven.

Towards the end of the school year, Cartwright regretted that Gerry, Amy, and Emily were leaving for they were three of the nicest, “especially Gerry she is my favorite of all here except Lily.”

The passionate nature of many nineteenth-century same-sex friendships has been discussed by others at length. In light of these studies, it is interesting that Miss Beale tried to restrict the development of sentimental friendships between girls. Josephine Kamm states that day girls could only walk to and from college together with the written permission of their parents. Furthermore, friendships between girls in different boarding houses were not allowed, and “a girl shared
a bedroom or was partnered on walks with someone who was believed to have
nothing in common with her."17 Yet the evidence from Cartwright's diary
suggests that Beale's methods of control were not wholly successful.

Keeping a rein on affections was also part of Miss Beale's prescription for
teacher-student relations. Idol-worship of a teacher or an older girl was a "waste
of time."18 The headmistress instructed her teachers to discourage any idolatry
which was sentimental and unhealthy. She would accept no demonstration that
encouraged hero-worship and would not accept flowers or presents on her
birthday.19 While histories of Cheltenham provide us with a clear idea of Miss
Beale's prescriptions, however, Cartwright's diary reveals the gap that could
develop between prescriptions and the actual behaviour of individuals. Despite
restrictions on hero-worship, Cartwright developed a crush on her history teacher,
Miss Soulsby, which was expressed in her diary. After an evening over tea with
Miss Soulsby, she wrote somewhat incoherently:

I had her all to myself. I feel as if I had told her everything. What shall
I do when the time comes. It is no use trying to say what she is like but
I long I don't know what for. Just anything to do for her. She told me
today she was confirmed May 6 my day.20

The same emotional fervour was also expressed in letters to her parents. She
wrote: "Daily I rejoice in Miss Soulsby's class. She is a darling and you can
hardly be in her presence without admiring her. I wish you knew her."21
Cartwright's parents did not share her enthusiasm, and in a subsequent letter, she
reassured them by saying: "Perhaps I exaggerated a little when I said I thought
of you and Miss Soulsby always. I seem to have distressed you a little. Don't
think that my affection for her or for you leads me to neglect what I ought to
do."22

The experience of an individual life, then, can often be read in a diary; but
so too can the inner life of an institution. Thus the second valuable contribution
made by Mabel Cartwright's diary is to illuminate the customs, purposes, and
character of the teachers and students who created the school community itself.
What, for example, did students actually study? Cartwright refers to twenty-six
girls in her class and at the exams only five of these had under seventy percent
for history.23 In another letter, she describes Miss Webster, "a young lady with
frizzled brown hair and gorgeously got up black satin," who taught them "nothing
new" about elocution.24 The possibility of an acquaintance attending Chelten-
ham inspired the reflection that studies at the school tended towards the general:

Cheltenham would not be at all a good place for her, as she wishes to
do certain things. It is impossible to be a specialist here. She would get
2 or 3 hours painting a week, 2 hours French, one or possibly 2 hours
literature, that is if she were in one of the 2 or 3 classes which do 2 hours
Literature a week.25
Cartwright herself studied metaphysics, psychology, literature, scripture, music, German, and calisthenics. This information expands what histories such as Kamm’s and Beale’s have said about the curriculum. Miss Beale’s original desire to “give sound instruction without sacrificing accomplishments, to develop the intellect without making female pedants” was clearly still in force. She introduced scientific teaching under the name of physical geography, which was not considered unfeminine since boys rarely studied it. Eventually the school introduced the traditionally “male” subjects of mathematics, science, Latin, and Greek to the curriculum as well.  

Without other sources to provide a context for an interpretation of girls’ education in this period, Cartwright’s diaries would be limited. Her writings do not reflect on the nature of girls’ education in the nineteenth century and it would be unrealistic to expect her to do so. Yet, as an additional source, the thread of the diarist’s narrative weaves into what is already known about Cheltenham and renders the latter more vivid. For example, the formal nature of examinations remains a dry fact until we see the exams through the eyes of the girls who “sat” them. Cartwright’s calm before one of her many examinations must have irritated some of her classmates. She wrote:

Exam: began today with Philology from 2 to 5. Very nice paper, 20 questions from which to choose 12. The examiner sat on the desk arrayed in academic gown and hood, appearing vastly amused whenever he looked up. The girls all thought me the most extraordinary for reading Rev. Gauntlet on the eve of an exam, but I don’t see the good of stewing at the last minute.

Various rules and disciplinary actions form a large part of the lore about private schools. The diary records when and how punishment was administered, as well as providing an insider’s opinion on the justice of those disciplinary actions. Kamm describes in detail the silence rules, which only allowed students twenty minutes of conversation during the morning. Delamont uses the rules to illustrate how the educational pioneers walked a precarious path, protecting their students from threats to their femininity, while allowing access to the male curriculum as their reward for good behaviour. Cartwright seems to regard the stress on order as an occasional nuisance, and she described the contrast between an expedition gathering buttercups in the fields freely, and “a stiff walk in rank, which [is] everyone’s pet detestation.”

A preoccupation with rules of the school can run the risk of ignoring the students’ interaction with those rules. The diary can serve as a reminder that demands made on the students were no different from the social norms that guided girls’ behaviour outside of school. Furthermore, the connection between discipline and moral appeal was an integral part of a religious vision which accepted the possibility of transgression, yet demanded continual reassertion of one’s determination to do better. The religious roots of the disciplinary exercise
followed a cycle of confession, forgiveness, and renewed resolve. Cartwright describes an incident in which she confessed an error to a teacher. She was inspired to do so after a scripture lesson from Miss Soulsby that called each individual to examine her conscience and seek forgiveness from those whom she had wronged. Yet although this incident loomed large in Cartwright’s memory, in general she did not feel that the rules were harsh or restrictive. In her diary Cartwright recorded that the teachers worked the students “very hard” and that it was “rather hard having no half-holidays.” But she still believed in the overall caring character of a school that had, nevertheless, “so few rules and so many advantages.”

The success or failure of individual students to conform to rules must be measured against the overall success or failure of the school to provide an atmosphere that was more than superficially genteel and feminine. Nineteenth-century schools for women shared the attempt to impose standards of deportment. However, Cartwright’s diary demonstrates that some of the ideals of the school were not matched by the reality of student behaviour. The school, for example, intended to recreate a family atmosphere, particularly in the boarding houses, which were supervised by a housemistress. But the atmosphere of the school was sometimes far from “lady-like”; Mabel Cartwright complained about some students at Cheltenham, for example, that

some girls seem to think (some of them) that rudeness is a prerogative of schoolgirls and I never heard any girls use the slang they do and words worse than slang—words that I have never heard my boy cousins say. The head girl uses language unfit for any lady’s mouth, and it is such a pity because she is exceedingly clever and might be nice if not for that—The head girl does not seem to feel any responsibility resting on her as head of this house.

The diary confirms what Dyhouse observes, namely, that women students at girls’ schools were caught between feminine and masculine models in behaviour, as in curriculum.

The diary can give the reader a sense of the deep spirituality which affected all of the individual’s life. Cartwright, for example, was no stranger to the spirituality underlying Beale’s leadership. Cartwright’s diaries demonstrate a strong sense of piety and spiritual vocation. Her later diaries from Oxford are filled with reflections on sermons and meditations, to the extent that one has to search for references to the more purely academic aspects of her life at Oxford. It would be a misrepresentation to attempt to separate spirituality from education in the lives of these women, since for both Beale and Cartwright the two were inextricably merged.

By reference to other activities and interests, the diary reminds us of aspects which were as much a part of the individual’s life as the educational quest. The situation of an individual life within the broader social and political context
counters the impression of cloistered young women in private schools, removed from contact with the world outside. Cartwright’s diary does deal with subjects other than education and religion, and it demonstrates a vivid interest in politics and communicates a sense of what it meant for her to be Canadian. On political and social issues she wrote:

I have left off being a Royalist now. I don’t want to, but I can’t help it, I never did believe, in my hottest days, in the divine Right of Kings to govern wrong, and now I can’t help seeing that the Puritans had right on their side.\(^{37}\)

News from Canada about Riel’s execution caused her to feel greatly unsettled: “Riel was executed yesterday at Regina. There was no disturbance, but I fear there will be.”\(^{38}\) Letters from home kept her conscious of her “true” country. When a barrel of apples arrived from her grandfather in Ontario, Cartwright wrote: “How homelike they [apples] looked, an emblem of Canada, all colour. We sent some to Miss Beale and to Miss Dodd, Mrs S. and the girls were delighted with them.”\(^{39}\) Her realization of cultural distinctiveness must have occasionally been accompanied by a desire to belong fully to the dominant English culture at Cheltenham. At a tea with one of her teachers, Cartwright told her “about our home and how we Canadians love England and there is no place like England.”\(^{40}\) She felt proud of the fact that Canada belonged to England and feared that “England won’t have us and won’t try to keep us from becoming independent and then we shall be worse off than ever.”\(^{41}\)

As seen above, the diary details changes and transitions in an individual’s life. For Mabel Cartwright, the school experience at Cheltenham came to an end on 18 October 1887 when she said farewell at a festival sponsored by the college. She realized that a chapter had closed and earnestly wrote in her diary: “Never may I forget this life since August 1885. Help me Lord to remember my responsibilities. Goodbye, goodbye.”\(^{42}\) On 29 October, the homecoming ship reached Quebec and by 31 October, Mabel was home with her family. The narrative of Cartwright’s education as described in her diary breaks off here, but later continues in her diaries and letters written from Oxford where she resumed her studies.

When Mabel Cartwright’s diary is read in the context of both institutional histories and more recent revisionist histories of women’s education, it inserts a sense of the ordinary routine and of individual experience into what otherwise might tend to remain a one-dimensional analysis. Furthermore, institutional histories can present a static view based as they are on greater units of time such as years and decades. A diary kept faithfully gives historians a daily perspective more tuned to the transitions in the individual experience. Institutional histories, particularly, are prone to present an image of a school which is correct, proper, and palatable to all. Any references to individual cases in these histories also tend to highlight the “exceptional” achievements. Diaries, by contrast, provide
the reader with the exceptional in a different sense, namely, the exceptions of individual experience, the practical and lived experience, as opposed to the ideology of the school’s policy. In this way, Cartwright’s diaries offer a freshness and a sense of immediacy which illustrate a young girl’s experience, often in accord but sometimes uniquely distinct from official school policy, as in the case of her passion for Miss Soulsby. In this the diaries support the revisionist interpretations of Vicinus and Smith-Rosenberg and underline the emotional complexity of female friendships.

Diaries can also act as a corrective to revisionist educational historiography, which needs to constantly reassess its own presuppositions. The call to consider ethnicity, class, and gender has often left religion behind. Yet, for most nineteenth-century women, the pursuit of education was a spiritual vocation. Secularization in the twentieth century meant that the chief motive for higher education, namely, the sense of spiritual vocation and the feeling of learning as a gift from God, was no longer shared by a growing number of college students. For headmistresses educated in the late nineteenth century, the challenge of adapting to modern “co-eds” would be considerable. In Cartwright’s future work as principal of St. Hilda’s in Toronto, she would face this dilemma. But during her time as a student she was not alone in her religious vocation.

NOTES


2. Estelle Jelinek cautions against considering autobiographical writings as direct insights into the inner life. Painful and intimate memories are often avoided and those individuals closest to the autobiographer are absent from the page. See Estelle Jelinek, ed., Women’s Autobiography: Essays in Criticism (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980), 10.

3. Cartwright’s father, John Robison Cartwright, studied at Oxford and Rugby, became a barrister in 1871, K.C. in 1890, and Deputy Attorney General of Ontario in 1889. Her mother, Emily D’Arcy Boulton, was the daughter of Lieutenant-Colonel D’Arcy Boulton of Cobourg. The diary itself is in the Trinity College Archives, Toronto, Cartwright Family Papers, MS 120, Box 5. I would like to acknowledge the assistance of Henri Pilon, Trinity College Archives, Sharon Larade, formerly of the
University of Toronto Archives, and Shirley Wigmore, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.

4. The Cheltenham Ladies' College has been the subject of a number of histories. See, for example, Josephine Kamm, *Hope Deferred* (London: Methuen, 1965), and *How Different From Us: Miss Buss and Miss Beale* (London: Bodley Head, 1958). A more recent reappraisal of the school which discusses its leadership is Carol Dyhouse, "Miss Buss and Miss Beale: Gender and Authority in the History of Education," in *Lessons for Life*, ed. Felicity Hunt (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1987), 22-38.


6. Ibid., 73.

7. Diary, 1885.

8. Diary, 31 Aug. 1885, Box 6.


10. See, for example, Diary, 24 Nov. 1884, and 26 Jan. 1885.

11. Mrs. Adams was the wife of a clergyman who befriended Mabel in Toronto.


13. Diary, 28 Nov. 1885.


15. Diary, 17 Apr. 1886.


18. Miss Beale wrote, "If they make an idol of any human being, when the idol is broken, their faith goes too." Quoted in Elizabeth Raikes, *Dorothea Beale of Cheltenham* (London: Constable, 1910), 256.

19. Ibid., 176.


24. Ibid.


31. Cartwright Family Papers, letter to parents, 12 June 1887.
33. Diary, 24 Oct. 1885. From a modern point of view, one might add that it was not a question of "no rules" at the college, but that the rules that existed were consistent with both society's expectations of female behaviour and the schoolgirls' perceptions of proper conduct.
35. Diary, 4 Nov. 1885.
36. Bryant, *The Unexpected Revolution*, 73, makes an interesting point about the religious integration of educational reformers. Understanding the way religion is part of their lives and the way the age encouraged the expression of religion makes it possible to use the older type of literature of the movement, including the less critical biographies.
37. Diary, 17 May 1886.
38. Diary, 24 Nov. 1865. A month later she described the execution of the eight Indians hanged at Battleford as "a blot on Canadian history" (28 Dec. 1865). She further questioned "how the Indians can ever be won to believe in the love of God when such things can be written of 'men' who call themselves followers of His Son." Mabel wondered who would lead the country after J.A. died. Her feelings for Sir John were quite clear: "I always did hate Sir John more than anyone living and I always will." Mabel wrote that she always loved Canada more than anywhere else.
39. Diary, 28 Nov. 1885.
40. Diary, 4 Dec. 1885.
41. Diary, 26 Dec. 1885.
42. Diary, 18 Oct. 1887.
43. A similar gap between the "ideal" and the "real" exists between educational intent and educational outcome; see, for example, Marjorie Theobald, "'Mere Accomplishments'? Melbourne's Early Ladies' Schools Reconsidered," *History of Education Review* 13, 2 (1984): 25.