

**HISTORICAL STUDIES IN EDUCATION**  
**REVUE D'HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION**

*DIVERGENCES ET CONFLITS EN  
HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION*

\*\*\*\*\*

*CONFLICT AND CONTRADICTION IN  
EDUCATIONAL HISTORY*

**VOLUME 3, NUMBER/NUMÉRO 2**  
**FALL/AUTOMNE 1991**



**Nous désirons remercier le Conseil de recherches en sciences humaines du Canada pour son aide financière, qui a rendu possible la publication du présent numéro. Des versions antérieures des articles ont été présentées lors du 6e Congrès biennal de l'Association canadienne d'histoire de l'éducation, Ottawa, Ontario, octobre 1990.**

**We wish to acknowledge the assistance in the publication of this issue of a conference publications grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. Earlier drafts of the articles were presented at the 6th Biennial Conference of the Canadian History of Education Association, Ottawa, Ontario, October 1990.**

*Historical Studies in Education/Revue d'histoire de l'éducation is indexed in/est indexée dans Canadian Education Index/Répertoire canadien sur l'éducation; Historical Abstracts; America: History & Life.*

# HISTORICAL STUDIES IN EDUCATION REVUE D'HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION

## *Co-editors/Rédacteurs adjoints*

Winnifred Millar  
London, Ontario

Ruby Heap  
Département d'histoire, Université d'Ottawa

Robert Gidney  
Rebecca Coulter  
Faculty of Education, The University of Western Ontario

## *Book Review Editor/Rédacteur des comptes rendus*

J. Donald Wilson  
Faculty of Education, University of British Columbia

## *Managing Editors/Rédacteurs en chef*

Judson Purdy  
Faculty of Education, The University of Western Ontario

Michael Owen  
Athabasca University

## *Editorial Board/Comité de rédaction*

Richard Aldrich  
Institute of Education,  
University of London

Paul Axelrod  
York University

Bruce Curtis  
Wilfrid Laurier University

Micheline Dumont  
Université de Sherbrooke

Nadia Fahmy-Eid  
Université de Québec à Montréal

Patrick Harrigan  
University of Waterloo

Marvin Lazerson  
University of Pennsylvania

Phillip McCann  
Memorial University

Joy Parr  
Queen's University

Robert S. Patterson  
University of Alberta

Alison Prentice  
Ontario Institute for Studies in  
Education

Peter Seixas  
University of British Columbia

Neil Sutherland  
University of British Columbia

Marjorie Theobald  
University of Melbourne

Michael Welton  
Dalhousie University

**Produced at the Faculty of Education, The University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, and Athabasca University, Athabasca, Alberta. The support of both institutions is gratefully acknowledged.**

**Publiée à la Faculté d'Éducation, University of Western Ontario, et à l'Université d'Athabasca, Athabasca, Alberta. Nous désirons souligner avec gratitude l'appui de ces deux institutions.**

**Les rédacteurs sollicitent des manuscrits, des rapports, des nouvelles et tout autre matériel susceptible d'intéresser nos lecteurs et lectrices, cela, tant en français qu'en anglais. Tous les manuscrits reçus seront soumis aux membres du Comité de rédaction et/ou à des personnes ressources.**

**Seuls les comptes rendus sollicités par le Comité de rédaction seront acceptés.**

**The editors invite submissions, in English or French, of manuscripts, reports, news items, and other material of interest to our readers. All scholarly manuscripts are refereed by members of the editorial board and/or other appropriate persons.**

**No unsolicited book reviews are accepted.**

**HISTORICAL STUDIES IN EDUCATION  
REVUE D'HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION**

Volume 3, Number/numéro 2

Fall/automne 1991

**TABLE OF CONTENTS  
TABLE DES MATIÈRES**

**6e CONGRÈS BIENNAL / 6th BIENNIAL CONFERENCE:**

**CONFÉRENCIER ET CONFÉRENCIÈRES INVITÉ(E)S /  
DISTINGUISHED SPEAKERS**

- 191 TOWARDS 2000: POVERTY AND PROGRESS IN THE  
HISTORY OF EDUCATION  
*Harvey J. Graff*
- 211 LA POINTE DE L'ICEBERG: L'HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION  
ET L'HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION DES FILLES AU QUÉBEC  
*Micheline Dumont et Nadia Fahmy-Eid*

**ARTICLES**

- 237 THE LINGUISTIC TURN: THE ABSENT TEXT OF  
EDUCATIONAL HISTORIOGRAPHY  
*Sol Cohen*
- 249 CHURCH TEEN CLUBS, FEMINIZED ORGANIZATIONS?  
TUXIS BOYS, TRAIL RANGERS, AND CANADIAN GIRLS  
IN TRAINING, 1919-1939  
*M. Lucille Marr*

- 315 Richard J. Altenbaugh. *Education for Struggle: The American Labor Colleges of the 1920s and 1930s*.  
(Kenneth Teitelbaum)
- 319 Donald G. Wetherell with Irene Kmet. *Useful Pleasures: The Shaping of Leisure in Alberta, 1896-1945*.  
(Morris Mott)
- 321 Jo Burr Margadant. *Madame le Professeur: Women Educators in the Third Republic*.  
(Patrick J. Harrigan)
- 325 Anne M. Boylan. *Sunday School: The Formation of an American Institution, 1790-1880*.  
(John Webster Grant)
- 328 M. Brook Taylor. *Promoters, Patriots and Partisans: Historiography in Nineteenth-Century English Canada*.  
(R. Douglas Francis)
- 330 Donald Soucy and Mary Ann Stankiewicz, eds. *Framing the Past: Essays on Art Education*.  
(Kerry Freedman)
- 333 Paul Rutherford. *When Television was Young: Primetime Canada, 1952-1967*.  
(Charles S. Ungerleider)
- 335 Shulamith Shahar. *Childhood in the Middle Ages*.  
(Neil Sutherland)
- 338 Peter Ward. *Courtship, Love and Marriage in Nineteenth Century English Canada*.  
(Patricia T. Rooke)
- 343 Carmen Luke. *Pedagogy, Printing and Protestantism: The Discourse on Childhood*.  
(Christopher R. Friedrichs)
- 346 E. Brian Titley, ed. *Canadian Education: Educational Themes and Contemporary Issues*.  
(J.D. Purdy)

- 349 CONTRIBUTORS/COLLABORATEURS
- 350 CHEA/ACHE
- 353 FRIENDS OF THE JOURNAL AND SUSTAINING MEMBERS  
AMI(E)S DE LA REVUE ET ABONNÉ(E)S DE SOUTIEN
- 355 POT-POURRI



## REVIEWS / REVUES

- 269 *The Histoire de l'éducation* and Canadian Historians  
*Patrick J. Harrigan*

## REVIEW ESSAYS / ESSAIS CRITIQUES

- 275 Interpreting Schooling in Nineteenth-Century Ontario  
*Donald Soucy*
- 285 What's New in the History of Adult Education  
*Michael R. Welton*

## BOOK REVIEWS / COMPTES RENDUS

- 299 Ruth Compton Brouwer. *New Women for God: Canadian Presbyterian Women and India Missions, 1876-1914.*  
(Margaret Prang)
- 302 Marguerite Van Die. *An Evangelical Mind: Nathanael Burwash and the Methodist Tradition in Canada, 1839-1918.*  
(William Westfall)
- 304 Harold Silver. *Education, Change and the Policy Process.*  
(Ronald Manzer)
- 306 Maria Tippett. *Making Culture: English-Canadian Institutions and the Arts before the Massey Commission.*  
(Mary Vipond)
- 309 Kendall E. Bailes. *Science and Russian Culture in an Age of Revolutions: V.I. Vernadsky and his Scientific School, 1863-1945.*  
(John F. Hutchinson)
- 312 Terry Crowley. *Agnes Macphail and the Politics of Equality.*  
(Tom Miller)

*Ce numéro est consacré aux communications et conférences présentées lors du Congrès de l'Association canadienne d'histoire de l'éducation, qui a eu lieu en Octobre 1990 à l'Université d'Ottawa. Le thème général du Congrès était*

**«DIVERGENCES ET CONFLITS  
EN HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION»**

*This issue is devoted to addresses and papers presented at the Conference of the Canadian History of Education Association in October 1990, at the University of Ottawa. The theme of the Conference was*

**“CONFLICT AND CONTRADICTION  
IN EDUCATIONAL HISTORY”**