Britain, rather than in India. A chapter entitled “Student Life” uses the student magazine and a diary of a student from the 1880s to elaborate on these processes. One rich theme Hornsey touches but never fully develops is the social position of British engineers and the social role that the Coopers Hill played, asserting that the school, which had higher tuition fees than British universities, “was designed to attract relatively wealthy families by offering their sons a career in India comparable, but never quite equal in prestige to the army or civil service” (8). His passive voice construction that Coopers Hill “was considered comparable with Oxbridge and Trinity College Dublin” (8) weakens the claim.

Because Coopers Hill had so few graduates and their career arcs were so focused, Hornsey is able to follow the lives of roughly a thousand of them after they left. He does this in three chapters, using diaries and reminiscences, as well as providing details on major projects Coopers Hill graduates worked on. Hornsey tries to relate the Coopers Hill curriculum with the actual work done in India. He also provides some details of the careers of the fifty-five non-Europeans who attended Coopers Hill.

Hornsey has gathered a remarkable collection of official publication and personal diaries, which allow him to tell the story of Coopers Hill in great deal. At times Hornsey seems so taken by the richness of his sources that he includes trivial details of little interest to the reader. For example, he goes into great detail about a medical procedure that a student diarist underwent, including the cost of the operation, the time the operation started, and even when the chloroform wore off! Similarly, Hornsey devotes thirty pages to the history of the Coopers Hill alumni society after the institution’s closing.

Few readers will likely be interested in the history of Coopers Hill as Coopers Hill. Hornsey’s tight focus on the students and faculty, with minimal consideration of the Indian people, give the book a celebratory tone, making it seem like a throwback to a much older and less critical literature on Britain and its empire in India. He has unearthed a great deal of material providing rich details on the culture of English engineering education, which could be useful for scholars who can provide their own framing.

Ross Bassett
North Carolina State University

Thomas O’Donoghue and Judith Harford


Piety and Privilege is a fascinating and well-argued book that focuses on the secondary school in Ireland from national independence in 1922 to 1967, within the context of the Catholic church’s close relationship with the state and the Church’s control over
education. The book closes in 1967 because in that year free secondary-level education was declared across the state. The authors clarify that Ireland refers to twenty-six counties that have existed as a political entity since 1922, after their exit from the United Kingdom.

In their analysis, O’Donoghue and Harford place schooling in the *longue durée*, the decades before the famine of 1845–48, which allows for a good historical understanding of the role of the church in Irish society from the time of independence. The authors have selected themes that run throughout the book, such as the church’s opposition to sharing the responsibility of running secondary schools with the laity; the convergence of the school’s aims and its concern with the salvation of souls with state initiatives to promote the Irish language and Gaelic culture; and the reproduction of the middle class. A feature the authors continue to unveil is the non-reflective didactic pedagogical approaches adopted in the schools.

It was, as Harford and O’Donoghue describe it in their chapter of the same name, a “Monastic monolith operation” (41). Since the majority of teachers were clerics in the 1940s, namely 60.8 per cent, the authors refer to both male and female clerics. Domestic and nursing arrangements were in the hands of sisters such as the Sisters of the Little Company of Mary. The larger congregation of teaching sisters in the state was the Sisters of Mercy, while for male students, it was the Irish Christian Brothers. The authors do not neglect to mention the presence of Protestant schools.

It is interesting how O’Donoghue and Harford trace patterns in students’ access to secondary school, finding a very limited system of scholarships as a potential incentive for lower social groups as well as the system’s lack of consideration of regional disparities. Until the 1960s, only one-third of students had completed primary schooling; the poor were not in a position to attend secondary school. The school’s work overall was part of the building of a national identity rooted in the Catholic faith and a loyal leadership. It is notable that the parents of privileged children attending school represented only thirteen per cent of the workforce. Needless to say, O’Donoghue and Harford masterfully insert education within the socio-economic context.

The authors create an experiential description and intricate analysis of the pervasive religious atmosphere in Irish secondary schools, whose stated purpose was to save souls; in this way, the church tried successfully to secure its place as a dominant partner. This fascinating historical analysis goes into gender construction, segregation of the sexes, and views of the body, once again contextualizing the issues in the European culture, the Catholic Church in Ireland, and beyond. The process of recruitment, namely, “seeking labourers for the vineyard” (107), shows the anatomy of the power of the church in action, and the authors tackle issues of sexual abuse.

The authors use primary sources, including materials from the various congregations. What is impressive about their approach is the integration of the experiences of various participating groups—lay people highly marginalized in the work of the schools—former students, and teachers. This approach enriches the historical study, which integrates structural components, agency, and voices in a critical social analysis. This book opens new avenues in terms of explanations regarding the interplay
of dogmatic positions of the church, particularly before Vatican II, and the actual space left for agency. This work is innovative in its attempt to draw on participants’ definitions of situations, while using a variety of sources and other conceptual tools.

The book makes a significant scholarly contribution and opens a new way of writing about schooling and the Catholic Church in Ireland. On one side, there have been extremely critical writings that have not explored the complex dialectic of the relationship between church and state, the national question, and people’s own religiosity. On the other side, other works have placed great emphasis on congregations’ contributions to Catholic schooling without including a critical experiential viewpoint. This work brings some fresh perspectives to the issues.

The book closes by moving to the future—“Looking backwards, looking forwards” (189)—toward a new approach to Catholic education. One that is pluralist and open to the world, involving new curricular approaches and a new understanding of piety. However, the authors make it clear that within the context of the expansion of education in Ireland, inequalities persist. Thus, they conclude by saying that Catholic secondary schools, just as their Protestant counterparts, continue to reproduce inequality, and that in spite of the significant changes that have taken place in Ireland since the 1960s, such as the movement away from a theocratic state and positive developments in the provision of secondary education, the Catholic Church continues to have significant control over this level of schooling.

I am impressed by the scope and design of this research, and I am certain that it will have a privileged place in the literature on education and the Catholic Church. The authors skillfully integrate the structural elements, enrich the social analysis with contributions from cultural history, and go deep into subjective aspects and experiential testimonies. This book will be of great interest to historians of education, historians of the Catholic Church, and historians interested in Ireland. It will also attract the attention of theologians. In summary, it will be of interest to a variety of readers, and, notably, is a book that will cover a lacuna.

I strongly recommend the reading of this book.

Rosa Bruno-Jofré
Queen’s University

Campbell F. Scribner and Bryan R. Warnick

Spare the Rod: Punishment and the Moral Community of Schools


Spare the Rod is a sobering examination of punishment in schools. While the study has global aspirations, it is concentrated on the United States. Its ontology is Western, drawing on legal, philosophical, and historical examples exclusively from scholars within the western tradition. The study is comprised of four core chapters. Scribner and Warnick are transparent about their purpose early in the introduction: “The goal