

considers the issue of what counts as evidence for transmission. Given that scholars so frequently cite argumentative similarities and visual diagrams for the transmission of ideas within a single culture, he questions why it is so difficult to accept this same sort of evidence in cross-cultural contexts. This meta-level analysis of the “debate” about Islamic influence is a breath of fresh air in what has become a somewhat stale scholarly conversation. Robert Morrison’s final chapter provides an additional dimension of analysis by looking at critiques of Ptolemy within the tradition of homocentric astronomy among Jewish scholars, which links to Sylla’s project of identifying aspects of the *hay’a* tradition in European texts. He also identifies an additional path of transmission of the Islamic models via Jewish intermediaries.

All told, for an edited volume the authors have done a brilliant job condensing a multidimensional, multidisciplinary, and multicultural argument into a coherent account of the Islamic influences on Copernicus. I must note, however, the lack of attention in the volume to astrology, which was certainly more central to the Copernican context than the mathematical musings of Nicolas of Cusa. All authors in this volume mention the practice of astrology, but always in relation to predictive accuracy and the construction of tables rather than for the importance of explaining the physical configuration of the universe. As Shank notes, “the clue to Copernicus’s mathematical transformation” (106) appears in Copernicus’s handwritten notes in a copy of Regiomontanus’s *Tabulae directionum et profectioum* and the *Alfonsine Tables*. Regiomontanus’s important astrological work was the first book of tables which provided values for two astrological points (*directio* and *profectio*), used for calculating the length of life, among other things. Lastly, given the focus on *scientific learning* in the title of the book, I expected to see more on teaching and universities. Sylla and Sally Ragep were the only contributors who treated science pedagogy in depth.

**Margaret Gaida**

University of Oklahoma

Rosa Bruno-Jofré and Jon Igelmo Zaldívar, eds.

*Catholic Education in the Wake of Vatican II*

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2017. 348 pp.

The Catholic Church has a lengthy history of councils, starting with the Council of Jerusalem mentioned in Acts 15. Over that history there is a consensus that the Second Vatican Council (1962–5) represents something different. Normally convoked to settle doctrinal questions or other problems (my favourite is the Council of Vienne, 1311–12, which addressed the problematic Knights Templar), “Good Pope John” XXIII called for a council on the Church itself, with the goal of *aggiornamento*, or bringing it up to date with the modern world. Exploring new vistas for religious freedom, relations with other Christians and people of other faiths and—of importance to this collection, Catholic education—“Vatican II” addressed the theme of

renewal; it is an impetus that has continued, however unevenly, to this day. Casting their nets almost as widely as the Fathers themselves to address Catholic education “in the wake of the Council,” editors Rosa Bruno-Jofré and Jon Igelmo Zaldívar offer a rich tapestry of experiences and ideas for our consideration in these post-conciliar, and now, post-Christian times.

On one level of understanding, the Council was about theology. Michael Attridge’s opening chapter sets a clear understanding of the neo-Thomism of Popes Pius IX (1846–78) and Leo XIII (1878–1903), marked by its sense of theological objectivity and timelessness, and the strong pull of post-Enlightenment philosophy, still the “handmaiden of theology” (25). At the dawn of the new century this objective/subjective struggle reached its nadir with the emergence of anti-Modernism during the pontificate of Pius X (1903–14), whose anti-modernistic oath was required, ironically, of all new bishops created through the years of the Council. But from the ashes of anti-modernism survived enough Catholic interest in *inductive* philosophical method to assert the importance to theology of history, context, and culture. A new emphasis on *ressourcement*, plumbing the scriptural, liturgical, and patristic sources of the early church, inspired the work of the *nouvelle* theologians, who desired engagement with the modern world, and set the stage for the work of Vatican II.

Influenced by the *nouvelle théologie*, the Council is revealed in this edited collection for its importance to Catholic education. Describing the transformation of Franco-era Spain (1939–75), Carlos Martínez Valle highlights *Unitatis Redintegratio* (the Decree on Ecumenism) and *Presbyterorum Ordinis* (the Decree on the Ministry and Life of Priests) for encouraging an educational vision rooted in experience, community, and social action. In her examination of Aboriginal education in Ontario, Lindsay Morcum points to *Lumen Gentium*’s (the Dogmatic Constitution on the Church’s) emphasis on the subjective experience of local churches, *Gaudium et Spes*’ (the Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World’s) sense of the church as a universal entity, and *Ad Gentes Divinitus*’ (the Decree on the Church’s Missionary Activity’s) call to bring the Gospel to all people as encouraging the inculturation of First Nations children. Other contributions to the book reveal mixed results for the religious orders heeding the Council. Paulí Dávila and Louis M. Naya’s chapter on the work of the Lasallian Christian Brothers in Spain’s Basque country credit it with providing the “theoretical tools” for a “reconversion” to their founding charisms, including care for the poor and a “shared mission” (93) with the laity; while in Chile, Cristián Cox and Patricia Imbarack find the renewal manifested differently for the Jesuit, Sacred Heart, and Holy Cross Fathers, whose departure from the country’s elite schools created a void eagerly capitalized on by Opus Dei and the Legionaries of Christ.

The Council as a source of inspiration to women religious, the universal backbone of Catholic education, comes through in the book with particular clarity. Bruno-Jofré’s examination of the Sisters of the Infant Jesus in Spain during the second half of the Franco regime (1957–75) reveals the importance of renewal, adaptation, dialogue, cooperation, and social justice to moving a highly “technocratic” local church “from Catholicism to Christianity” (111). Heidi MacDonald’s consideration of “Women

Religious, Vatican II, Education and the State in Atlantic Canada” points to the Council as “recalibrating” (170) the work of women religious and the state in Prince Edward Island, Nova Scotia, and Newfoundland. And as Canada’s foremost authority on the history of women religious, Elizabeth Smyth, reports, the Council’s openness, humanity, and strong democratic spirit encouraged the Sisters of St. Joseph of Toronto to explore new missionary work in education, healthcare, and social service in Latin America. Smyth reaches the conclusion that Vatican II “reinforced the fact that the key constant in the lives of many of these communities is change” (166–7).

Representing a variety of thematic and disciplinary approaches, some of the contributions in this book do not always reconcile easily with what is, admittedly, a broad subject matter. Bernard Hugonnier and Gemma Serrano’s survey of the “Longue Durée” relationship between Catholic education and the state in France, and William F. Pinar’s reconsideration of Pier Paolo Pasolini’s film adaptation of “The Gospel According to St. Matthew,” suggesting a connection between renewal and public pedagogy, offer few specific connections to the Council. And Christopher Beeman, in his philosophically-themed piece on “Indigenous Education as Failed Ontological Reconfiguration,” while raising important concerns for the ways First Nations understand the world and their place in it, disregards the commitment to immersion and inculturation undertaken by orders of women and men over entire lifetimes when he concludes on the Council as another failed “colonial project” (285). So, too, Joe Stafford’s examination of *Gravissimum Educationis* (the Declaration on Christian Education) in Ontario misses the trees by seeing only the forest, focussing on the challenges to educational renewal in an era marked by nascent secularism, lay empowerment, and state control. If, as he claims, the renewal was not reaching the schools of Toronto, the most progressive diocese in English-speaking Canada, then where? So much was achieved in this period in Ontario. Practically all of it, from the *synodal* exercise of the “Bishops Brief,” to the *subsidiarity* characterizing the push to “complete” funding of the province’s Roman Catholic separate school system to the end of high school, was in synch with the Council.

However, these are small quibbles that do not detract from an important collection coming at a propitious time. Relating to an international sense of Catholic education in terms of its theology, its direct and indirect influences, and the agency of religious and the laity, *Catholic Education in the Wake of Vatican II* presents the Council for what it is—one of the most important projects in the history of the Church. That something changed as a result of the Council will be a problematic revelation for those people who only understand it through the hermeneutic of *continuity* within the church’s rich tradition. But, as the authors in this volume make clear, the Council’s wake has resulted in significant changes for Catholic education, changes that, under the leadership of Francis, the first modern pope not also a Council Father, seem destined to continue.

**Peter Meehan**

St. Mark’s College,  
University of British Columbia