

**HISTORICAL STUDIES IN EDUCATION  
REVUE D'HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION**

Volume 12, numbers/numéros 1 & 2  
Spring/printemps & Fall/automne 2000

*Co-editors/Rédacteurs adjoints*

William Bruneau  
Faculty of Education, University of British Columbia  
Thérèse Hamel  
Faculté des sciences de l'éducation, Université Laval

*Book Review Editor/Rédacteur des comptes rendus*

Timothy J. Stanley  
Faculté de l'éducation/Faculty of Education  
Université d'Ottawa/University of Ottawa

*Editorial Board/Comité de rédaction*

Paul Axelrod  
York University

Pierre Caspard  
Institut national de recherche pédagogique

Ruth Compton Brouwer  
University of Western Ontario

Brigitte Caulier  
Université Laval

Sol Cohen  
University of California at Los Angeles

Ruby Heap  
Université d'Ottawa

Roy Lowe  
University of Birmingham

Alison Prentice  
University of Victoria

Geoffrey Sherington  
University of Sydney

Elizabeth Smyth  
University of Toronto

Nicole Thivierge  
Université du Québec à Rimouski

J. Donald Wilson  
Professor Emeritus,  
University of British Columbia

Managing editor/secrétaire à la rédaction: Russell Wodell

**Thanks/Remerciements**

*We thank the Faculties of Education at the University of British Columbia, Université Laval, and the University of Lethbridge for their financial and administrative support.*

---

*Nous tenons à remercier les Facultés d'éducation de l'Université de Colombie-Britannique, de l'Université Laval et de l'Université Lethbridge de leur soutien administratif et financier.*

La *Revue d'histoire de l'éducation* est publiée deux fois l'an, au printemps et à l'automne, par l'Association canadienne d'histoire de l'éducation.

L'abonnement est de 30,00\$ (35,00\$ à l'extérieur du Canada) pour les particuliers (25,00\$ et 30,00\$ pour les étudiant-es, les retraité-es et les non-salarié-es) et de 45,00\$ (50,00\$ à l'extérieur du Canada) pour les institutions. Toute correspondance concernant les abonnements et la publicité doit être adressée au Secrétaire à la rédaction, *Revue d'histoire de l'éducation*, Faculté d'éducation, 2125 Main Mall, Université de Colombie-Britannique, Vancouver, Colombie-Britannique, Canada, V6T 1Z4, email: [hse@telus.net](mailto:hse@telus.net); toute correspondance concernant les comptes rendus doit être adressée à Prof. Diane B. Purvey, Chair, School of Education, University College of the Cariboo, P.O. Box 3010, Kamloops, BC, Canada V2C 5N3, [dpurvey@cariboo.bc.ca](mailto:dpurvey@cariboo.bc.ca). Les "Directives pour les auteur-es" paraissent à la page vi.

*Historical Studies in Education* is published twice annually by the Canadian History of Education Association.

Individual memberships are \$30.00 (\$35.00 outside Canada) for the calendar year (\$25.00 and \$30.00 for students and retired or unsalaried persons); institutional subscriptions are \$45.00 (\$50.00 outside Canada) for the calendar year.

Address all correspondence concerning subscriptions and advertising to the Managing Editor, *Historical Studies in Education*, Faculty of Education, 2125 Main Mall, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada, V6T 1Z4; e-mail: [hse@telus.net](mailto:hse@telus.net); all correspondence concerning book reviews to Prof. Diane B. Purvey, Chair, School of Education, University College of the Cariboo, P.O. Box 3010, Kamloops, BC, Canada V2C 5N3, [dpurvey@cariboo.bc.ca](mailto:dpurvey@cariboo.bc.ca). "Guidelines for Authors" appear on page vi.

---

*Historical Studies in Education/Revue d'histoire de l'éducation* is indexed in/est indexée dans *Canadian Education Index/Répertoire canadien sur l'éducation*; *Historical Abstracts*; *America*; *History & Life*; *Sociology of Education Abstracts*.

---

ISSN 0843-5057

*Historical Studies in Education/Revue d'histoire de l'éducation*  
Volume 12, numbers/numéros 1 & 2  
Spring/printemps & Fall/automne 2000

# HISTORICAL STUDIES IN EDUCATION / REVUE D'HISTOIRE DE L'ÉDUCATION

Volume 12, numbers/numéros 1 & 2  
Spring/printemps & Fall/automne 2000

## CONTENTS/MATIÈRES

vii Editorial Note

### ARTICLES

- 1 Roads Not Taken: Victorian Science, Technical Education,  
and Canadian Schools, 1844–1913  
*Suzanne Zeller*
- 29 The Rise and Fall of a Science of Adult Education at  
The University of British Columbia, 1957–85  
*Eric J. Damer*
- 54 Montréal Catholic School Teachers, International Unions,  
and Archbishop Bruchési: The Association de bien-être des  
institutrices et institutrices de Montréal, 1919–20  
*Geoffrey Ewen*
- 73 Phyllis Grierson, Margaret Ross, and the Queen's Hall Girls:  
Intergroup Conflict Among University College Women 1910–21  
*Charles Levi*
- 93 The Influence of Carnegie Corporation and Teachers College,  
Columbia, in the Interwar Dominions: The Case for  
Decentralized Education  
*Richard Glotzer*
- 111 A Fondness for Charts and Children: Scientific Progressivism  
in Vancouver Schools 1920–50  
*Gerald E. Thompson*
- 129 Awakening a Demand for Schooling: Educational Inspection's  
Impact on Rural Nova Scotia, 1855–74  
*Robert Lanning*

## FORUM

- 143 Traditions and Transitions in Teacher Education:  
The Development of a Research Project  
*Sandra Acker*
- 155 After the Fall: Can Historical Studies Return to Faculties of  
Education?  
*Robert A. Levin*

## RESEARCH NOTE

- 163 Towards a History of Educational Research in Canada:  
Content Analysis of the *AJER*  
*Henry A. Hodysh*

## ESSAY REVIEWS

- 169 Traditions of American Education: Diane Ravitch's  
*Left Back: A Century of Failed School Reforms*  
*Sol Cohen*
- 182 Must Biography Be Educational?  
*William Bruneau*

## BOOK REVIEWS/COMPTEs RENDUS

- 201 Bonnie G. Smith. *The Gender of History: Men, Women, and  
Historical Practice*  
[Alison Prentice]
- 204 Beverly Boutilier and Alison Prentice, eds. *Creating Historical  
Memory: English-Canadian Women and the Work of History  
from the Great War to the Age of Television*  
[Rebecca Priegert Coulter]
- 205 Paul Anisef et al. *Opportunity and Uncertainty: Life Course  
Experiences of the Class of '73*  
[Robert Clift]
- 207 Spencer Boudreau. *Catholic Education: The Québec Experience*  
[Jean-Pierre Proulx]
- 210 Thomas McGrath. *Politics, Interdenominational Relations and  
Education in the Public Ministry of Bishop James Doyle of Kildare  
and Leighlin, 1786-1834*  
[Thomas A. O'Donoghue]

- 212 William J. Buxton and Charles R. Ackland. *American Philanthropy and Canadian Libraries: The Politics of Knowledge and Information*  
[Donald Fisher]
- 214 Mark G. McGowan. *The Waning of the Green: Catholics, The Irish and Identity in Toronto 1887-1922*  
[Elizabeth Smythe]
- 216 Marilyn Färdig Whiteley, ed. *The Life and Letters of Annie Leake Tuttle: Working for the Best*  
[Cathy L. James]
- 218 Adrian Vicary. *In the Interests of Education: A History of Education Unionism in South Australia*  
[Harry Smaller]
- 221 CONTRIBUTORS/COLLABORATEURS
- 223 Announcement of Editorial Vacancy

## ERRATUM

The editors greatly regret the accidental omission of Ruth Compton Brouwer from the list of the Editorial Board/Comité de rédaction in Volume 11, nos. 1 and 2. We offer this blunder to the future editors as an example of the vital importance of independent proofreading.

## Guidelines for Authors

Manuscripts in English should be sent to William Bruneau, Editor, *Historical Studies in Education*, Department of Educational Studies, Faculty of Education, 2125 Main Mall, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada, V6T 1Z4; e-mail: [hse@telus.net](mailto:hse@telus.net). Manuscripts in French should be sent to Thérèse Hamel, Rédactrice, *Revue d'histoire de l'éducation*, Département d'orientation, d'administration et d'évaluation en éducation, Faculté des sciences de l'éducation, Université Laval, Québec, Québec, Canada, G1K 7P4. Text and footnotes should be double-spaced. For English manuscripts, follow *Chicago Manual of Style* (14th ed.), or *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association* (4th ed.), and *Oxford Canadian Dictionary* spelling. Four paper copies should be submitted.

Authors whose manuscripts are accepted for publication will be asked to supply a copy on diskette and/or by e-mail. WordPerfect, Ms Word, and ASCII files are all acceptable.

This journal supports the elimination of sexual, racial, and ethnic stereotyping.

Submission of a manuscript implies that the work contained therein is the author's own, and that no substantial part of it has been submitted for publication or has been published elsewhere.

### Directives pour les auteur-es

Faire parvenir les textes en français à Thérèse Hamel, Rédactrice, *Revue d'histoire de l'éducation*, Département d'orientation, d'administration et d'évaluation en éducation, Faculté des sciences de l'éducation, Université Laval, Québec, Québec, Canada, G1K 7P4. Faire parvenir les textes en anglais à William Bruneau, Editor, *Historical Studies in Education*, Department of Educational Studies, Faculty of Education, 2125 Main Mall, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada, V6T 1Z4; e-mail: [hse@telus.net](mailto:hse@telus.net). Les textes et les notes de références doivent être dactylographiés à double interligne. Pour les textes en français, vous référer au *Chicago Manual of Style* (14<sup>e</sup> éd.), ou à *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association* (4<sup>e</sup> éd.). Quatre copies manuscrites du texte doivent être soumises au Comité de rédaction.

Les manuscrits seront acceptés aux fins de publication doivent être présentés sur disquette ou par poste électronique. Les fichiers en WordPerfect, MS Word, ou ASCII sont également acceptables.

La revue encourage la suppression de tout stéréotype sexuel, racial, et ethnique.

La soumission d'un texte à la *Revue* implique que le travail réalisé est le propre de l'auteur-e et qu'aucune partie substantielle du dit texte n'a été préalablement soumise pour publication ou déjà publiée ailleurs.

## Editorial Note

Like volume 10 (1998), this issue of *HSE/RHE* draws together a set of thematically linked papers. More than three-quarters of the articles, notes, and essays we here publish, are drawn from the recent conference of the Canadian History of Education Association/Association canadienne d'histoire de l'éducation, held at the University of Western Ontario in 2000 October. The Editorial Board and our anonymous peer reviewers were delighted by the quality of those papers, and take pleasure in presenting them, in most cases in somewhat revised form.

Even as we prepare for publication of the next issue of the journal, our editorial team is in the midst of change. With this number, Tim Stanley (Université d'Ottawa) leaves the office of Book Review Editor for *HSE/RHE*. We thank Tim for his several years of energetic and able work in this important and popular "department" of *HSE/RHE*.

We are pleased to announce that Diane Purvey (University College of the Cariboo) has accepted appointment as Book Review Editor as from 2001 January 1. Diane's electronic and ordinary mailing addresses appear in the front matter of this issue of the journal. Her extensive background in Canadian social and educational history will serve the journal, and the book review section, very well.

And still on matters of personnel, we wish to announce the departure from office of the Editors of *HSE/RHE*, effective 2001 July 01. Thérèse Hamel and Bill Bruneau may well have a little more to say in a future editorial note about the journal's past and its likely future development. For the time being, they draw your attention to the notice of vacancy published in the end matter of the volume in your hands. We hope that members and friends of the journal will carefully consider whether they may wish to advance their candidacy for this important job. If the Search Committee can provide information or assistance, please get in touch with the chair, William Bruneau.

Finally, we turn to a number of innovations in the journal's form and content.

Regular readers of *HSE/RHE* will remember that since 1997, the journal has published a number of short and medium-length articles and essays under three special rubrics: *Forum*, *Research Notes/Correspondence scientifique*, and *Documents*. After a brief hiatus, we are happy to include in the present issue two new papers in two of these "departments," *Forum* and *Research Notes/Correspondence scientifique*. Potential and future writers of items for any of these rubrics may like to know we warmly welcome new entries. In most cases these pieces need not be subjected to the usual peer review procedures (although it happens that one of the *Forum* pieces in the present issue, Professor Acker's paper, passed through review).

With the present volume, we inaugurate a new feature in the book reviews/essays department, the publication of *Essay Reviews*. These papers may be fairly lengthy, and provide an opportunity for extended analysis and evaluation of significant new work in our field, for exploration of historiographical questions and debates, for comparative studies of recently-published work, and similar matters.

We hope readers and friends of *HSE/RHE* may find helpful these new departments and rubrics—and that many of us will choose to write new work for any (or all) of them.

A la prochaine.

# Roads Not Taken: Victorian Science, Technical Education, and Canadian Schools, 1844–1913

Suzanne Zeller

Historians have carefully examined the tortuous development of Canadian technical education, defined as the means of imparting skills, techniques, and applied principles in preparation for the practice of a trade or profession. They rightly attribute a growing "movement" for its inclusion in public education during the last quarter of the 19th century to the social and economic challenges of industrialization and urbanization. This movement not only raised concerns about children and youth but broadened to include adult education, drawing inspiration from successful technical schools abroad, and gaining momentum from Philadelphia's Centennial Exposition in 1876.<sup>1</sup>

To investigate the deeper historical foundations of this technical education movement is to evoke James Hutton's famous geological adage, "no vestige of a beginning,—no prospect of an end." The 1913 Royal Commission on Industrial Training and Technical Education formulated a "blueprint for the implementation in Canada of the 'new education'" which combined intellectual development with preparation for entrance into industrial society,<sup>2</sup> but proposed only the vaguest strategies for integrating technical education into the country's institutional mainstream. Although 19th-century Canadians staked their material, social, and moral progress on modern science and technology, their policymakers never decisively embraced technical education as indispensable to the fulfilment of such ambitions.

One explanation for this reluctance rests with the general consensus that Canada's economic future, including its industrial development, relied almost exclusively upon staple production. The Laurier government's "wary indifference" toward technical education thus stemmed not only from constitutional compli-

---

<sup>1</sup>R.M. Stamp, "The Campaign for Technical Education in Ontario, 1876–1914," unpublished PhD thesis, University of Toronto, 1970; Neil Sutherland, *Children in English-Canadian Society* repr. (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999), Part IV; David S. Enns, "Technical Education and Industrial Training in Early 20<sup>th</sup> century Canada: The Royal Commission of 1910," unpublished MA thesis, Dalhousie University, 1982; Janet Guildford, "Technical Education in Nova Scotia, 1880–1930," unpublished M.A. thesis, Dalhousie University, 1983; B. Anne Wood, *Idealism Transformed* (Montréal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1985); Donald MacLeod, "Practicality Ascendant: The Origins and Establishment of Technical Education in Nova Scotia," *Acadiensis* 15, 2 (Spring 1985): 53–92; Robert Gagnon, "Les discours sur l'enseignement pratique au Canada français, 1850–1900," in Marcel Fournier, Yves Gingras, and Othmar Keel, eds., *Sciences et médecine au Québec* (Québec: Institut québécois de recherche sur la culture, 1987), 19–39.

<sup>2</sup>S.J. Gould, *Time's Arrow, Time's Cycle* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1987), 63; Sutherland, *Children*, 199–200; J.R. Millard, *The Master Spirit of the Age* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1988), 13, 25.