name. Some children came from tribes which were historically antagonistic to one another. "We Hopi hated Navajos," one narrator recalled (p. 141). A positive result of tribal mixing was that the children required a common language in order to communicate, providing a forceful incentive to learn English.

Coleman’s history of Indian education is thoroughly absorbing, partly because it speaks through the pupils themselves and partly because it enhances and corroborates other published accounts. The narrations ring true, because despite diversity of response they are consistent about what happened. With equal balance, this book puts the native back into native history without resorting to either romanticism or overcompensation.

Marilyn Millward
Dalhousie University


The sixteen chapters in Issues in the History of Education in Manitoba present a series of snapshots in the province’s educational history. Although, as Ken Osborne writes in his Introduction, they do not claim to provide a comprehensive history, nevertheless they go a long way to sketching in more fully a framework supplied by D.S. Woods in the 1930s and Keith Wilson and Alexander Gregor in the 1980s. Although two chapters have been previously published as articles, most have been written specially for this collection, and the editor must be congratulated for her energy both as an entrepreneur and as a scholar: she is responsible for two chapters on her own, and is a co-author of two others and a co-compiler of a chapter of memoirs as well.

After Osborne’s sensitive introduction, which dispenses with old simplistic chestnuts of how culture is transmitted in favour of more complex and complicated interpretations, the chapters are arranged in seven sections. The first, “The Public Construction of the Common School,” carries articles on the Manitoba School Question of the late 1890s and on the struggle over modernization in Manitoba education between 1924 and 1960. The second section bears a poetic title, “Opening Pedagogical Spaces,” which refers to union activities in Brandon before 1920, Mennonites and education between 1888 and 1948, and the issue of Ukrainian language education. The third section on Teacher Education contains one chapter, referring to post-Second World War teacher education. The two chapters in part four examine teachers’ organizations during the interwar period. Part five contains two chapters on aboriginal education, one a historical study and the other an advocacy for improvement in the future. Part six, labelled “Women,” has two chapters of autobiographical reminiscence from Sybil Shack, a historical study of the Oblate Sisters and their
involvement in education at the beginning of this century, and a chapter on women teachers in rural towns, 1947-60. The final part, "Memoirs," is a collection of reflections written by former teachers.

Gerhard Ens, Marcella Derkatz, and Brian Titley show how the consumers of education were rarely passive vessels for current educational theory, particularly when it carried the agenda of "Canadianising" new citizens in the shape of a dominant British-Ontario mould. Neither Mennonites, nor Ukrainians, nor aboriginals adhered to what Osborne terms "Anglo-conformity" in educational policy of the first half-century or so of Manitoba's existence. (Nor of course did French-Canadians, as Monique Hébert's new work makes abundantly clear.) And as Osborne reminds us in his urbane introduction, and Tom Mitchell and Rosa Bruno-Jofré show in their article on union activity in Brandon, there were disputes over what was important in English-language values. On the supply side of educational theory, reformers struggled to modernize the province's educational system into larger educational units, with a more professionalized and bureaucratized staff. Benjamin Levin, in an excellent piece, shows how the reformers were thwarted not by conspiracy, or even opposing ideas, but by their own insensitivity to the views of rural residents who saw a threat to rural life contained in a move to provide equal opportunities to children in all parts of the province.

The chapters on teacher education, and teachers' organizations, by Alexander Gregor, Mitchell, and Bruno-Jofré, all show how very concerned the teachers themselves were about control over their own occupation and the matter of upgrading standards of entry into the profession. A certain defensiveness about this issue permeates the chapters which quote the opinions of teachers themselves. Teachers' organizations always had the difficult job of protecting members who were underqualified at the same time as attempting to exclude such people from the profession in future. That the Teachers' Federation, later the Society, worked so well for its membership, particularly in the late 1950s and during the expansion of the 1960s, is a tribute to their leadership and a renewed sense of confidence among teachers themselves. Of the chapters in the book, only Shack's "Teaching as Growth" alludes to this time period. Much more historical work remains to be done about education in Manitoba.

For my part, I think the best part of the book is found in the two chapters written by Sybil Shack. Student, teacher, activist, principal, administrator, historian, she made history herself as first woman principal of a Winnipeg high school, and "served on more councils, boards, committees, executive bodies, and task forces" than she can now remember (p. 507). Unabashedly autobiographical, so skilled is her writing, so perceptive her remarks, and so well buttressed by statistics and archival research are her stories, that the reader can obtain a first-rate, first-hand account of education in Manitoba since 1917 through her narratives. She is sometimes ironic but she is always generous and
her anecdotes illuminate the main point of her writing. Despite the lack of an index and bibliography, future historians will benefit from all chapters in the book, and, I suspect, from Shack's in particular.

Mary Kinnear
University of Manitoba


Raymond Huel has been a major force in the organizational development of the Western Oblate History Project and has worked consistently to see to it that a balance exists in all the forums and presentations at the conferences. Honouring the significant contributions of the Oblates has not blinded the organizers from recognizing serious human distortions and mistakes from the past. The true missionary narrative, determined through an honest and open encounter of many perspectives, both religious and secular, becomes the essential ingredient that will help people come to terms with the past and hopefully pave the way to a better future. Research by all related disciplines into what actually took place as Euro-Canadian missionaries and the First Peoples encountered each other in Western and Northern Canada is a significant key to dealing with highly charged issues (such as the residential school matter) that have inflicted such deep and hurtful woundedness upon this nation. Native and non-Native storytellers, scholars, and researchers all need to co-operate in this quest.

*Western Oblate Studies 2* constitutes the proceedings of the second symposium of the History Project which took place in Edmonton in July, 1991. What is of particular significance for the event in question is that in 1991, the Oblates marked the 150th anniversary of their arrival in Canada with special celebrations. The July 24th convocation was special in that it featured an apology and a homiletical commentary to the apology by the Rev. Douglas Crosby, OMI, president of the Oblate Conference of Canada. The proceedings include both texts (in English and French), which are certain to become established as important historical documents.

Four papers in the proceedings deal with the controversial issue of residential schooling and these shall be the focus of this review.

Jacqueline Gresko's essay examines everyday life in the Qu'Appelle Industrial School at Lebret, Saskatchewan. She writes from a Native student's perspective and concludes that, especially under the effective leadership of cross-culturally enlightened missionaries in the nineteenth century, this school was relatively successful in helping its students relate to the local aboriginal communities and provided cultural continuity for the students. Industrial schools differed from residential institutions in that they tended to receive more government funding and supervision; were located away from reserves; enrolled older students and