

his imperialist, militaristic message. Despite this, by 1914 hundreds of thousands of boys had responded to the adventure promised by scouting stories and rituals and had accepted the essentially conservative message of self-discipline, the work ethic, and the need for order. Indeed, MacDonald argues that by the beginning of the war, scouting had become a patriotic institution which was linked in the public mind to images of the nation, the King, and the flag, and "to hope, faith and charity" (p. 195).

*Sons of the Empire* is a skilful and persuasive textual and historical analysis of the interplay of mythmaking, individual, and collective beliefs and how these became popularized through newspapers and literature. It is unfortunate that the demands of modern publishing do not permit any extensive discussion of differing interpretations and interesting asides in what are at times very sparse and, to this reader, often unsatisfying endnotes. Moreover, though MacDonald does contrast the myth of Baden-Powell, the master scout of Mafeking, with the "reality" of the siege, he does not engage in a similar discussion with respect to other "heroes" of the time, notably Fred Burnham, the other "most famous scout of the Empire" (p. 64).

More dissatisfying to this reader is that the second part of the study, the making of the boy scouts, does not consistently illustrate all the intellectual themes so carefully developed in Part One. MacDonald states that *Sons of the Empire* is "a study of masculine ideology" (p. 6). In part, the story of the boy scouts is the story of creating,

or perhaps re-creating, appropriate models of "masculinity." The frontier was, after all, a man's world. To Baden Powell, recreating the frontier, through the scouts, was a way to meet "the crisis in masculinity" (p. 17) which was striking British society. Unfortunately, MacDonald does not explicitly pursue how Baden-Powell's and the public's notion of masculinity were translated in the Boy Scout movement itself. For example, what were boys' relationships to their mothers, their sisters, and other girls/women supposed to be? How did scouting cope with sexuality? How did the mythology of the boy scouts with respect to manliness compare to the mythology of womanliness (if one existed) that was being promoted in the new girl guide movement?

Such reservations aside, *Sons of the Empire* is a fascinating study of ideas in action and a welcome addition to our understanding of the creation and use of myths in responding to apparent social ills and anxieties.

Jane Errington  
Royal Military College of Canada

**Michael C. Coleman.** *American Indian Children at School, 1850-1930.* Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 1993. Pp. 230. \$37.50 cloth.

This book intrigues at first sight, with its cover a field of faces from the Carlisle Indian School in Pennsylvania. Little girls to grown men at first seem similar but become so real it is

difficult to stop staring sadly back at row upon row of pupils posing glumly for the photographer. Michael Coleman's previous book on nineteenth-century missionary attitudes to American Indians demanded he look to the other side of the question of "cultural uplift," the motivation behind the Indian schools. Here he has examined the written public-school reminiscences of more than a hundred Indian voices, not simply to let them speak, not only to compare them with missionary and government accounts, and not just to fire the debate on the validity of oral and recalled history, but to explore another segment in the complexity of interaction between the European and aboriginal cultures, particularly considering to what extent the narrators, as pupils, were cultural brokers or mediators between the white world and their own. His study spans the period from 1850 to 1930, when criticism raged against the idea of "culturally intolerant education" (p. xii) of the Indians in the United States. The reader whose experience has been confined by Canadian content is surprised to learn of this early American movement to make amends and to institutionalize respect for tribal cultures. For in 1930 the Canadian government was still opening Indian residential schools, founded on principles already apparently abandoned in the United States.

This is a finely designed book, one chapter leading into the next as smoothly as a series of gates into gardens. Each concludes with a new beginning to compel the reader along a journey that starts with traditional home education, follows a deep path

through the new world that is the school, and finally winds back to the reservation. The memories might recall a church mission school near the reserve or a government boarding school that drew its pupils all the way from the prairies to Pennsylvania. It might be a reminiscence from the 1880s or forty years later, but the stories meld and blend as one so smoothly that no questions bother the reader, asking when and where. It is a whole experience, the Indian experience in the white school, and time and place simply become subsumed under the spell of the narrative. Even while immersed in the tale, the reader realizes that this is not a one-sided account, not one collective aboriginal voice speaking with one accord. It is a collage of overlapping opinions mixed with stories standing alone, in which the memories first collide and then collaborate with one another. This of course lends them credence, for while every face in the picture tells a tale, the stories relate uniquely individual motivations and responses to strikingly similar situations.

Coleman speaks of mutual exploitation: the missions and governments paraded and publicized "model" pupils in their efforts to gain public support for their schools; the children harvested knowledge for both personal and collective advancement. Many returnees attempted to teach their elders, prompting one parent to ask ruefully, "What shall I do with my daughter, who is now my mother?" (p. 181).

Opposing the common supposition that the schools were completely foreign, the narratives offer the idea that formal education often reflected

home training in many ways. At home as at school most tribal children learned manners and morals, were taught to respect elders, progressed in a graduated way, and earned prestige and status through effort and accomplishment. Even at home there was a division of labour and of learning. While the boredom of the classroom is often cited as an alien restraint to native exuberance, it had its parallel on the reservation. Remembering the time spent learning beadwork at her mother's knee, one informant wrote that "always after those confining lessons I was wild with surplus spirits" (p. 17). Even the new names with which some children were christened at school had an aboriginal counterpart, where a birth name might be replaced with one relating to behaviour or achievements, and might, in a strong parallel to what happened at school, be given as a mark of entry into a society or to stimulate imitative behaviour.

There is also a suggestion that the severe discipline of the boarding schools, so often specified to damn them, was less rigid than the training at home. Even those narrators who idealized their traditional upbringings recognized it was "serious business" (p. 30). One boy recalled having had his head repeatedly plunged into a pail of water as punishment by his uncle, though he ran screaming and thought he would die; another mentioned initiation rites involving severe whipping. As in the schools, negative incentives included humiliation, open mocking, and ostracism. Yet some children found their first peace at boarding school: "I was ten years old.

I didn't know that people died except by violence" (p. 74).

From many of the boarding schools, the students were sent on "outings" or work terms which placed them with firms or families for a few months each year. This removed them from their ethnic peers in a system of total immersion, and was consistent with the goal of assimilation into white society.

On the matter of enforced enrolment, in which truant officers and Indian agents are usually seen to have wrenched children from their homes and hiding places, one informant claimed that some of the resistance to school was symbolic. "Tradition required," she wrote, "that it appear that I was forced to school" (p. 63). This is not to suggest that all children were volunteers, for as Coleman repeatedly remarks, the underlying feeling behind all aspects of Indian education was ambivalence: while some families resisted the removal of their children to the schools, others requested it; while some pupils ran and rejected their schooling, others ran and returned; some simply remained. Recruitment was sometimes a duty of the older pupils, and as one narrator recalled in a few words which offer the reader an animated picture, occasionally older boys still in school were sent home to "catch" girls who refused to enroll.

In one school in North Dakota, twenty-seven tribal groups were represented. This caused special problems. One child was astonished to learn there were any other Indians besides those on his own reservation, and another, who didn't know he was a "Mohawk," fought a boy who called him by that

name. Some children came from tribes which were historically antagonistic to one another. "We Hopi hated Navajos," one narrator recalled (p. 141). A positive result of tribal mixing was that the children required a common language in order to communicate, providing a forceful incentive to learn English.

Coleman's history of Indian education is thoroughly absorbing, partly because it speaks through the pupils themselves and partly because it enhances and corroborates other published accounts. The narrations ring true, because despite diversity of response they are consistent about what happened. With equal balance, this book puts the native back into native history without resorting to either romanticism or overcompensation.

Marilyn Millward  
Dalhousie University

Rosa del C. Bruno-Jofré, ed. *Issues in the History of Education in Manitoba: From the Construction of the Common School to the Politics of Voices*. Lewiston/Queenston/Lampeter: Edwin Mellen Press, 1993. Pp. 653. \$109.95 Cdn. cloth.

The sixteen chapters in *Issues in the History of Education in Manitoba* present a series of snapshots in the province's educational history. Although, as Ken Osborne writes in his Introduction, they do not claim to provide a comprehensive history, nevertheless they go a long way to sketching

in more fully a framework supplied by D.S. Woods in the 1930s and Keith Wilson and Alexander Gregor in the 1980s. Although two chapters have been previously published as articles, most have been written specially for this collection, and the editor must be congratulated for her energy both as an entrepreneur and as a scholar: she is responsible for two chapters on her own, and is a co-author of two others and a co-compiler of a chapter of memoirs as well.

After Osborne's sensitive introduction, which dispenses with old simplistic chestnuts of how culture is transmitted in favour of more complex and complicated interpretations, the chapters are arranged in seven sections. The first, "The Public Construction of the Common School," carries articles on the Manitoba School Question of the late 1890s and on the struggle over modernization in Manitoba education between 1924 and 1960. The second section bears a poetic title, "Opening Pedagogical Spaces," which refers to union activities in Brandon before 1920, Mennonites and education between 1888 and 1948, and the issue of Ukrainian language education. The third section on Teacher Education contains one chapter, referring to post-Second World War teacher education. The two chapters in part four examine teachers' organizations during the interwar period. Part five contains two chapters on aboriginal education, one a historical study and the other an advocacy for improvement in the future. Part six, labelled "Women," has two chapters of autobiographical reminiscence from Sybil Shack, a historical study of the Oblate Sisters and their