CONSTRUCTING NOVA SCOTIA’S “SCOTCHNESS”:
THE CENTENARY CELEBRATIONS
OF PICTOU ACADEMY IN 1916

B. Anne Wood

During the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries north-eastern Nova Scotia was flooded by an invasion of Scottish immigrants. Most were Gaelic-speaking Highlanders. Those who were Roman Catholic moved on to the Antigonish area; the remaining Presbyterians settled largely in the rural hinterland of the Pictou district. After the Napoleonic Wars they were joined by a number of Scots from the Lowland areas. While most of the post-1815 immigrants were farmers and artisans, a large number were business and professional people, especially teachers and clergymen. As could be expected, the latter group were intent on developing the commercial possibilities of the district, building schools to train their upwardly mobile progeny in the skills needed by a rapidly developing commercial-industrial economy and in adapting their language and institutions to this North American society. These English-speaking Scottish-Canadians were joined by approximately another 170,000 Scottish immigrants between 1815 and 1870, 33.7 percent settling in Nova Scotia and many in the Pictou County area. As J.M. Bumsted notes, they tended to fraternize together and were particularly active in establishing schools that emphasized training for the talented. Graduates became highly visible in politics and in business; “nearly 50 percent of the nation’s industrial leaders in the 1880s had recent Scottish origins.” Bumsted further believes that it “was largely because of their influence that the preponderant culture in Canada was British, rather than English, and distinct Scottish patterns can be discerned in Canadian education and moral attitudes.”

1. I would like to thank John Reid, Conndal Wood, and the two anonymous readers of HSE for their constructive criticisms of an earlier draft of this paper, which was presented to the Annual Meeting of the Canadian Association for Foundations in Education at Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island, June 6, 1992.


3. Ibid. And see B. Anne Wood, “The Significance of Evangelical Presbyterian Politics in the Construction of State Schooling: A Case Study of the Pictou District,
Although large numbers of Scots continued to emigrate to Canada after 1871 (80,000 between 1871 and 1901; 240,000 between 1900 and 1914; and 200,000 between 1919 and 1930), most settled in Ontario and the West and quickly became assimilated. A substantial population with Scottish origins remained in the Maritimes, however, and developed a culture distinct,Burnstedt claims, from other groups originating from the British Isles. Indeed, Burnsted notes that many of these Scottish Canadians considered themselves "superior to" their English, Welsh, or Irish neighbours.

Contradicting Burnsted's claims, other historians state that by the late 1870s Scottish models had lost their force in higher education;\(^4\) that Scots rarely took advantage of Nova Scotia's 1841 legislation permitting them to educate their children in Gaelic; and that "the Protestant Scots lost their distinctive culture even more rapidly than the Catholics, partly because they were even more anxious than the Catholics to flee the rural areas which were the stronghold of the old language."\(^5\)

John Reid does admit that, despite this assimilation process, the mythology of the Scottish tradition remained strong, especially when it was used to form the basis of an ideology of meritocratic selection in which limited equality of opportunity was held to justify the reinforcement of structural inequalities. Citing the excellent parallel work of R.D. Anderson in Scotland, Reid argues convincingly that the myth of a democratic intellect began to attain a momentum of its own, particularly during a period of rapid socio-economic change such as the beginning of the twentieth century.

Using Pictou Academy as a case study, this paper will argue that a Scottish "progressive" mythology was inculcated primarily through an elitist form of schooling; that this myth on the surface promoted individualism and meritocracy, values synchronizing with Pictou's capitalistic industrial economy; but that bureaucratic school practices and repressive disciplinary policies instead indoctrinated students with a deferential outlook more in keeping with the emerging bureaucratic, centralizing policies at both provincial and national levels of government. The tension between these two world views was played out in the forty years leading to the Academy's centenary celebrations in 1916. In effect, community leaders were attempting to achieve a market edge for Pictou Academy graduates in the commodification of credentials, but they were also trying to


maintain their hegemonic control of schooling and cultural affairs in the district. These mixed messages had a major impact on students and their middle-class parents, leading them to construct a third world view, based on interests of gender and class as well as on middle-class evangelical values. These various voices of dissent questioned the Scottish mythology which dominated the rhetoric during centenary celebrations. This examination of the process of construction of these mental attitudes, therefore, will provide the focus for the central question being addressed in this paper, namely, what function did the Scottish myth of a "lad of parts" play in the jostle for ascendancy of three world views in the Pictou district?

As T.J. Jackson Lears suggests regarding any examination of cultural hegemony, "ideology is less a product than a process in which different meanings are produced and reproduced through the establishment of a mental attitude toward the world."6 Lears and other American historians note the crucially important role played by organized religion in the actual exercise of power of one group over another.7 In both Canada and the United States a new class of capitalistic entrepreneurs concerned themselves with the creation of a new stratum of intellectuals whose role was to win over traditionalists to support the modern social, economic, and political state and to create a single national culture. These leaders were in a symbiotic relationship with religious leaders and with the new social order; they were deputies in exercising social hegemony and political government. Their construction and operation of state schooling systems played a significant role in this re-fashioning process.

The sources available for this period particularly suit this type of study. While public records reveal administrative structures, political trends, and educational policy, all of which tend to serve provincial and even national interests, local newspaper accounts, private correspondence, journals, and oral interviews expose voices of dissent. The latter reveal political pressures not often included in the public record. These voices of dissent also tend to spell out the prevailing ethos, in the case of Pictou Academy the individualistic world view of the male student striving for access to college and to the professions, which may differ significantly from the purported communitarian school goals advanced by evan-

7. Michael Gauvreau, "Beyond the Half-Way House: Evangelicalism and the Shaping of English Canadian Culture," review essay in Acadiensis 2, 2 (Spring 1991): 158: "the old [Canadian] national history and the new social history were united in marginalizing the religious experience and in failing to recognize its creative role in shaping cultural traditions, social forms, and political ideologies." ibid., 159: "American historians have shown little reticence in explaining not only how the changing religious experience provided much of the ideological underpinning of the American 'middle class' in the early decades of the 19th century, but also how Protestant religion, in both the formal sense and in terms of the cultural values it promoted, contributed to an ongoing process of institutional and state formation."
gelical church and school leaders. Thus, not only does this paper examine the political process of cultural construction but it also notes the rhetoric employed by bureaucrats, by evangelical moralists, by adolescents, and by female alumni. Ironically, out of this jostle for cultural ascendancy emerged effects unanticipated by any of these groups. Class tensions tended to be exacerbated, females began to behave more assertively, Pictou Presbyterians withdrew from union with the emerging United Church of Canada, and male community leaders established a boarding school for male students in an effort to re-construct traditional values in their schooling culture.

Before proceeding to the analysis, however, it is necessary to review the economic and political context of the study. By the 1890s Pictou County, twenty years in advance of all other eastern Canadian districts, had successfully been transformed from an economy based on primary manufacturing to one based on secondary producer goods; a previously seaward-facing shipbuilding economy in the 1840s had, because of the coal and steel of the New Glasgow area and the construction of railways, become a landward resource economy. Primary manufacturing in the region included foundries, sawmills, gypsum mills, salt works, and iron smelting furnaces. Secondary consumer goods were emanating from breweries, flour and grist mills, soap and tallow plants, tobacco and confectionary manufacturing establishments, carriage, tin and sheet-iron works, but especially from the heavy metal industrial plants. The New Glasgow area was considered the “Birmingham of the North.” Capital investment increased from $587,000 to two million dollars in Pictou County between 1871 and 1891. In 1882 the Nova Scotia Steel Company was incorporated; by 1895 it had become a giant corporation with $2,060,000 capitalization. Owning its own blast and open-hearth furnaces, rolling mills, forges, foundries, and machine shops, and employing over 6,000 persons, Scotia represented the most fully integrated industrial complex in the country.

Pictou County, as Del Muise suggests, provides one of the best examples of the juxtaposition of a traditional and an emergent economy. In the election of 1867 James MacDonald, a Pictou Academy graduate who had been Commissioner of Railroads and Financial Secretary to Sir Charles Tupper, carried the town of Pictou and a number of polls along the railroad line. However, he lost heavily in New Glasgow, under the hegemony of James W. Carmichael, Liberal free trader, shipbuilder, and merchant. The final result, 2,011 votes for Carmichael and only 1,653 for MacDonald, reflected the political battles which were staged at the local level between Antiburgher (Secessionist) Liberal Presbyterians and Church of Scotland (Kirk) Conservatives. They continued age-old feuds.

that had been waged in the early history of the Academy and of the district. While these battles were to continue for the remainder of the nineteenth century, reflecting continuing pre-Confederation and religious principles, the Conservative Party considered Pictou County as a centre of strength within the province. These Pictou Conservatives supported the National Policy, which assumed centralizing trends of the federal government, state capitalism, and deficit financing (especially in the areas of schooling and railway construction) and which led, unbeknownst to Pictonians, to eventual loss of control over regional development. As the stock market technique of promoting and securing capital dominated North America by the 1900s, the Pictou entrepreneurs had to give way to Montreal and to American financiers. The previous Conservative voting majority dissolved and the population of Pictou County remained at an average of 35,000 between 1891 and 1911, while other parts of Canada experienced great rates of growth.10

Reflecting the progressive ethos of the region in this post-Confederation era, town boosters could point to the built environment of their Shire Town. As described in J.H. Meacham’s Illustrated Historical Atlas of Pictou County, Pictou of 1879 is a town of no ordinary importance, situated as it is on the north side of the harbor, on gradually rising ground; its position, as seen from the water, is both commanding and attractive. During the last few years a large number of elegant houses have been erected within its

---

limits, especially in the more elevated position of the town. Here we find commodious and handsome mansions—modern villas—and neat cottages, all of which are unmistakable indications of the opulence and prosperity of its inhabitants. The public buildings are likewise worthy of notice. The courthouse, registry office, and custom-house, which include the Inland Revenue Office, views of which appear among our Illustrations, stand foremost in this class—the latter building especially, which was erected by the Government at a recent date, is an ornament to the town.  

Other marks of a progressive, middle-class Victorian community cited in the atlas were the establishment of the Pictou Bank, the formation of a branch of the Young Men’s Christian Association, the presence of six churches, a Masonic hall, two newspapers, and Pictou Academy, which was “ably conducted by A.H. MacKay, Esq., principal, and Messrs. R. and E. McLellan, his coadjuitors, with Miss Campbell in the primary school. This college affords superior advantages, and more especially to those who have been born in the County, as they have special privileges not enjoyed by those whose birth-place is outside its limits.”

Since its foundation in 1816, Pictou Academy had followed market trends and had had to compete with other Maritime denominational colleges and regions.

11. J.H. Meacham and Company, Illustrated Historical Atlas of Pictou County, Nova Scotia (Philadelphia: Meacham, 1879). 12. Pictou was the second town in the province to be incorporated, two years after the passage of the County Incorporation Act of 1882. This legislation led to the gradual centralization of provincial government capital expenditures, such as bridges and roads, and the gradual loss of control by municipal and town councils over their own officials. The latter increasingly asked for protection as professionals against partisan strife in their local communities: see J. Murray Beck, The Evolution of Municipal Government in Nova Scotia, 1749-1973 (Nova Scotia Royal Commission on Education, Public Services and Provincial-Municipal Relations, Sept. 1973). A number of Pictou Academy graduates were provincial and town council leaders, directly involved in this professionalization process. Many served on the Pictou Academy Alumni Association, formed in November 1893. Of the 114 members in 1896, 37 percent (42) were professionals, 26 percent (30) small businessmen, 9 percent (11) administrators, 4 percent (4) skilled craftsmen, 3 percent (3) students, and 3 percent (3) politicians. All were male. Eighteen (15 percent) had moved to other parts of Canada or to foreign countries.

12. Meacham, Illustrated Atlas, 11. Meacham cites the 1871 census figures regarding the religious breakdown of Pictou County: Presbyterian Church of the Lower Provinces, 14,105; Church of Scotland [Kirk], 12,250; Roman Catholic, 2,965; Church of England, 1,470; Wesleyan Methodists, 797; Baptists, 345; all others, 193. Muise estimates that by 1881, 79.7 percent of the population was Presbyterian and 82.3 percent was of Scottish origin: see “Elections and Constituencies,” Appendix II.
to attract students. Pictou County merchants constructed a meritocratic institution whose graduates at an early stage in its history won access to Dalhousie College and to the legislature, thereby threatening the hegemony of the Anglicans over higher education and control of provincial affairs. The existing patronage system fell as the Pictou Presbyterians established a new system of order and spearheaded the drive for responsible government (won in 1848) and for higher education. By mid-century a more democratic, activist (evangelical) Presbyterian Church was evolving in the province and its leaders strongly promoted a free, common school system. Nova Scotia’s first two superintendents of education were evangelical Scots. John William Dawson, an eminent Pictou Academy graduate, was appointed Principal of McGill College in 1855. He was succeeded by the Reverend Alexander Forrester, who successfully campaigned to obtain the Free School Acts of 1864-66 and to establish a system of provincial grants which rewarded high-quality institutions, such as Pictou Academy. Once this funding and provincial legislation was in place, the Academy became much more secure and was able to defeat its rivals in the region, thereby gaining a monopoly on superior secondary schooling in Pictou County. Having estab-


14. As Margaret Conrad observes in retrospect, Forrester’s replacement by Dr. Theodore Rand, his younger Baptist colleague at the Normal School, “was popular with the Baptists who were strongly represented in the ranks of the Conservative Party and who harboured a grudging sense that Presbyterian influence had undue weight at provincially funded institutions such as the Normal School and the recently resuscitated Dalhousie College. It also satisfied Conservative partisans who saw Forrester as an unregenerate Liberal who had actively campaigned against [Dr. Charles] Tupper in the Cumberland election of 1857.” See “‘An Abiding Conviction of the Paramount Importance of Christian Education’: Theodore Harding Rand as Educator, 1860-1900,” in *An Abiding Conviction: Maritime Baptists and Their World*, ed. Robert S. Wilson (Hantsport: Lancelot Press, 1988), 162. The reorganization of Dalhousie College was spearheaded by a number of Pictou Academy graduates, such as Principal William Dawson, Honourable Adams Archibald, Reverend George M. Grant, and the Reverend Dr. James Ross, who became the new president following in the footsteps of McCulloch.

15. In 1865 Pictou Academy, Mount Allison, the Institute of the Deaf and Dumb, and King’s College each received a legislative grant of $1,000, all other academies (Horton, Yarmouth, Halifax Grammar, and Acacia Village) receiving $500-$600 or no grants: Table F, Appendix No. 13, *Journal of the House of Assembly [JHA]* 1866. The Provincial Normal and Model Schools were granted $3,815. Prior to Colchester Academy being nominated as the provincial model school, Pictou Academy competed vigorously with other institutions to win this prize, acquiring diagrams, maps, blackwalls, an arithmeticon, a theodolite sextant, and globes, and mounting exhibitions of students’ phonography (Pitman’s phonetic shorthand), maps, and pen drawings to impress the authorities in 1850 and in 1851.
lished its hegemony over school affairs in the region, in 1873 the board appointed a former student and recent Dalhousie graduate, Alexander H. MacKay, to be Principal of Pictou Academy. Under his able administration not only the Academy, but the whole province, was co-ordinated into one efficient system of education, in imitation of Ontario and American models.

While admission standards had been introduced in 1857 by the trustees in an effort to control the large number of students in the first, or preparatory, class, MacKay extended these powers dramatically. He took over all admission examinations to the Academy in 1874 and became the supervisor for all the common schools of the town of Pictou, including in his responsibilities the examination of the six females and one male teacher. By 1877 he succeeded in having all

16. In 1862 New Glasgow petitioners attempted to wrest half the grant from Pictou Academy, claiming that their two-storey building could house three hundred students and would be designed as nearly as possible to promote the modern classroom methods of the new Truro Normal School, thus serving the more practical (vocational) needs of the region. Their efforts were roundly defeated by the more powerfully entrenched Pictonians: Copy of petition, George Murray et al. to Lieutenant Governor, New Glasgow, 1 Mar. 1862, 1-2: Public Archives of Nova Scotia [PANS], Micro: Places, Pictou Academy, Reel 2.

17. See N.M. Sheehan, "Alexander H. MacKay, Social and Educational Reformer," in Profiles of Canadian Educators, ed. Robert S. Patterson et al. (Canada: Heath, 1974), 253-70. Born of Scottish parents, MacKay taught school in 1864, graduated from the Provincial Normal School in 1866, and from Pictou Academy in the summer of 1868. During the winters of 1869-72 he studied at Dalhousie College; during the summers he again taught in his rural district of Pictou County. In 1873 he graduated from Dalhousie with a Bachelor of Arts degree, honouring in mathematics and physics. Later he followed the coursework at the University of Halifax and received the degree of Bachelor of Science with honours in biology. In 1873 he was appointed Principal of Annapolis County Academy, but in November transferred to Pictou Academy. In 1892 he was appointed Nova Scotia's sixth Superintendent of Education. His career, and that of another Pictou Academy gold medallist, Henry F. Munro, who succeeded MacKay as the seventh Superintendent of Education in 1926, illustrated the rise of the impoverished "lads of parts," which became a significant strand in Nova Scotia's Scottish mythology of the late nineteenth century.

common school classes graded. Arguing that he should be remunerated, MacKay got the town to grant the Academy $860 from its school fund. He reorganized the Academy classes into two separate but equal streams, mathematics and science, and English and classics. In 1878 Superintendent David Allison highlighted Pictou's organic administrative model in his Annual Report. The excellence of the Academy attracted a majority of its students from the county at large (71) and its quality of instruction drew an attendance (138) more than treble the average attendance of any other similar institution.  

The next year Allison asked MacKay to draw up a course of study for the public schools of the province. Their intent was to establish a graded system of schooling and common standards. By 1881 Grade Eight class work became the standard required for county academy entrance examination. The accreditation of teachers was changed to correspond to this new grading system, which in turn was used as a lever to force all academies to conform to new matriculation standards, introduced first by Pictou Academy and then adopted province-wide in 1884. These new regulations effectively removed accreditation of teachers and entry to denominational colleges from local boards and faculty; they centralized control in the Council of Public Instruction, a committee of cabinet responsible for educational policy. Even bar and medical entrance examinations were partially given over to the province. By 1885 the system was completed with the passage of the "Act to encourage Academic Education," which forced county academies to conform to a three-year model introduced by Pictou Academy in 1881. All counties were to establish and maintain one academy or high school free of charge to qualified students from all parts of the county.

In 1889, MacKay's last year at Pictou Academy, students were organized in platoons, all covering the same subjects with their cohort. Four specialized

20. 48 Vict., chap. 11. The licensing of teachers, standards of admission, courses of study, equipment, and design of building were to be prescribed by the Council of Public Instruction [CPI]. Provincial grants and teachers' salaries for all academies (including Pictou Academy) were now to be based on the qualification of the teachers (academic level required for all county academies), and on the number of students in stipulated high school subjects. Strict procedures were to prevail over entrance examinations, set by the CPI and based on subjects of the provincial course of study for the common schools. Annual inspections were to be conducted to ensure compliance with the regulations, and annual reports were required of each county academy. A minimum number of students had to pass each annual examination in order for the grant to be received.
21. First-year students (103 in number) studied reading and elocution, composition, drawing, arithmetic, algebra, geometry, modern geography, British history, physics, and the keeping of accounts. A smaller number (65) of first-year students took the rudiments of Latin, French collections (45), botany (67), and physiology (78).
teachers taught these classes for one hour each. The first-year academic class was partially adapted to the teachers' programme for Grade D licence; higher classes corresponded to work demanded for licences C to A. Many of the students presented themselves for the provincial teachers' examination. In the winter term of 1889, for instance, 181 of Pictou Academy's 245 students tried the exams. Of these, only 169 (69 percent) passed. Of the original 181 students who applied, 46 already had teaching licences, and 12 more of these became teachers by 1893. Because of the new academy regulations, therefore, these institutions were serving gate-keeping, credentializing functions, primarily for the teaching profession.

They were also acting as holding grounds for larger numbers of adolescents increasingly barred from the job market as the industrial economy waned and as professional ranks swelled (leading to demands for higher credentials). In 1891, only 16 percent of the first-year class were promoted. While 21 percent of the second-year and only 14 percent of the third-year students were promoted, all except one of the fourth-year group passed. Tenure followed similar patterns and also varied according to the domicile of the student. For instance, 79 percent of the third-year students from outside Pictou County (26 in number) remained at the Academy for only two years; 72 percent of those from Pictou Town (10) were in attendance for five or six years. Of the latter group, only two females were promoted. A similar "holding pattern" existed for Pictou Town students (22) in the second year; 86 percent of them attended for four to six years and only eight were promoted. Although half the 279 students in 1891 were from Pictou Town, their promotion rates (12 in year one; 8 in year two; 2 in year three; 3 in year four) demonstrate that they were not given any special advantage over their rural counterparts as far as promotion was concerned. As R.D. Anderson observes, "liberal social theory legitimated a competitive, individualist society; if the social hierarchy was open to merit, and genuine talent could always reach the top, then middle-class social domination was felt to rest on ability rather than [on] privilege."25 He also speculates that because a large number of leaders in Scotland

---

22. Table 17, AR 1889, Appendix 5, JHA 1890, 17.

23. Register of the Attendance, Studies and General Standing of Pupils in School Term Ending April 1889, PANS, Micro: Pictou Academy Register. The 46 licensed teachers included 20 with B Grade, 22 with C Grade, and 6 with D Grade certificates. There were 14 females and 32 males, whose ages varied from 15 to 44 years.


25. R.D. Anderson, Education and Opportunity in Victorian Scotland (Oxford: Claren-
came from a wide social range, the democratic myth of the “lad o’ pairs” could be used by educational reformers as a justification for their remodelling of the system along class lines which reinforced structural inequalities; in an industrial age, meritocracy was held to be necessary because there was limited opportunity.  

David Hogan also argues that the competitive promotions examinations joined the classroom to the marketplace. “Competitive exams thus assumed a position in meritocratic ideology similar to the one assumed by free and competitive markets in capitalistic doctrine: they promoted effort, achievement, and character, they invigorated learning, they opened up channels of educational mobility for the meritorious, they tested and rewarded competence, they punished the indolent, and they matched merit to social position...In fact, success in examinations was little more than successful entrepreneurship in an educational setting.”  

These normative, moralistic reasons were apparent in MacKay’s justification for his increased imposition of examinations on Pictou Academy students in 1884:

What is the use in every one going up to examination? Here were some reasons. It showed the student how much he really knew of the work he had been studying during the term. It showed the teacher where the weak point in his method might be looked for. It showed parents, guardians, and those interested, the teachers’ estimate of the work done. But especially was it useful in giving the student a drill in the rapid and accurate expression of his thoughts on paper, an art without which no amount of knowledge and study can make a successful man at a modern competitive examination....[The disposition to shirk] examinations...might always be taken as characteristic of a man whose future career as a student might be expected to be a failure.

Aside from serving as the main gate-keeper to higher education, school administrators were also constructing a normative mythology, shortly to be tied in to supposedly Scottish characteristics of poverty, industriousness, merit, and later success, which diverted attention from the results of this constructed culture. This normative mythology diverged significantly from the prevalent Romantic Scottish mythology, expressed in Victorian novels which highlighted the feu-
dal/clan origins of the Scots, their gaelic language, and distinctive tartan dress. It was countered by "Cecil," writing in *The Morning Herald* (Halifax), who stated categorically that Pictou Academy's curriculum was designed to train mature students for entry to Dalhousie College. He questioned whether this necessarily meant that Pictou Academy was the best educational institution in the province. Cecil also intimated that its high grant of $1,400 "had very much the appearance of a bribe, or especial inducement, to Pictou County to support the late leader [Pictou Academy graduate and later Conservative Premier Simon Holmes] and his colleagues in the recent election...considered in connection with what the Presbyterian body already enjoys of public money invested in Dalhousie College, [it] induces one to believe that in this Province justice has her blind eye turned in the direction of those institutions which are under the especial patronage of our Presbyterian brethren."  

Taken in conjunction with one estimate that in a fifteen-year period Pictou Academy students had netted over $20,000 in Dalhousie bursaries, it was becoming apparent that the Scottish- Presbyterian monopoly on provincial educational prizes was resented.

Resentment over competition and prize-giving had been expressed thirty-four years earlier by female students. In 1848 when the first silver medal was awarded to George M. Grant, one female student had registered her displeasure by refusing to accept any prizes. By 1853 only four female students were in attendance at the Academy and the trustees were worried. Rival female teachers had attracted the girls to their schools, offering more of an "accomplishments" than a strictly academic curriculum. The trustees decided to set up a private Female Department in the Academy in 1854; it achieved the goal of attracting back 21 female students. The majority stayed only for one year, however, and their curriculum of English, French, printing, and ornamental needlework was much less rigorous than those of the female academies at Amherst and at Sackville (Mount Allison). Following the publicity given in Nova Scotia by Forrester to the humane model-school teaching methods of Scotland's David Stow, evan-

29. "Cecil," *The Morning Chronicle* (Halifax), 25 Nov. 1882. He suggested that the withdrawal of the $1,400 grant from Yarmouth Seminary may have been in retaliation against "the late member of Yarmouth, for his violent opposition to their College Bill."


gelical Presbyterian school culture began to influence common schooling and family life in Nova Scotia, countering the strict disciplinary culture of the academies. Miss Christie’s infant school in Pictou, which exemplified this more experience-centred approach, was described by W.N. Rudolf in 1862:

It was an interesting sight to see, and hear, the children going through their lessons with so much evident pleasure to themselves—These schools are very different from those I went to when a boy—The system of the Model Schools has often been styled jokingly “learning made easy,” and really one must feel that there is some truth in the remark—for the instruction is communicated in so easy, and pleasant a manner to the children, that they never seem to weary, or find learning a lesson a task.\(^{33}\)

As David Hogan comments, this form of “affectionate authority” developed a dyadic relationship between the child and the teacher which internalized authority and developed conscience, as well as capacity for rational obedience.\(^{34}\) While this pedagogy eschewed competition and prize-giving, it was still stressing modernization, individualism, and integration of the middle class with capitalist society. But these evangelicals wished Protestant values to temper the spirit of capitalism; industry, usefulness, co-operation, and service were to dampen the pursuit of self-interest. What experience-centred school reformers were instilling in middle-class children were values which would become part of the moral code of capitalism. Promise-keeping, self-denial, and conscience were all necessary for contractual relationships. But the conscience also conferred social, moral, and psychological identity on individuals in a market society. Female students and less competitive male students, critical of the mindless drill and authoritarianism of MacKay’s regime,\(^{35}\) increasingly supported the fine arts programme at the Academy, which gave them a sense of identity and social accomplishment.

The fine arts programme also defined the genteel respectability increasingly demanded of female culture by both the Presbyterian Synod and the middle-class

---

Toronto Press, 1985), 176; Sir Henry P. Wood, *David Stow and the Glasgow Normal School* (Glasgow: Jordanhill College of Education, 1987); Alexander Forrester, *The Teacher’s Text-Book* (Halifax, 1867), and his education reports and *Journal of Education* from 1855 to 1864.


leaders of the community. 36 Maggie McKenzie, a Pictou Academy graduate of the 1870s who became Nova Scotia’s first female to achieve a Grade A (academic) teacher’s licence, provides an illustration of this new role definition and how it merged with the new accomplishment curriculum. In 1882 McKenzie applied for the position of mathematics teacher at Pictou Academy following the resignation of Roderick MacKay. She offered to teach at a lower salary, thereby winning support for her application from the Town Council. Unfortunately, one of the town common school teachers, Hector Innes, an Academy gold medallist of 1878, had resigned in expectation of the position. A newspaper debate ensued as to which gender was capable of enforcing discipline. 37 At the same time, under the instigation of A.H. MacKay, a committee of the Presbyterian Synod was appointed in June of 1881 to look into the perceived problem of the 188,921 Maritime Presbyterians who had no institution in connection with Presbyterian colleges devoted to the higher education of young ladies. MacKay and the committee brought forward a prospectus for a Pictou Academy Ladies’ College whose board offered shares as a private company at ten dollars each in an attempt to raise $40,000 to build the college. 38 The effort failed because of the heavy mortgage incurred by the town two years earlier to build a magnificent new Pictou Academy. 39

Needless to say, MacKay’s solution to the McKenzie-Innes issue was to appoint the latter to the academic position and, in 1882, to hire McKenzie to begin a separate non-academic programme, which by 1888 was affiliated to Pictou Academy and was largely supported by female students. By 1893-94 there were 40 students (including 3 males) enrolled in the music programme. 40 Emulating the credentialism and professionalization strongly marking the academic programme, the fine arts calendar highlighted the academic background of its music teachers: for example, Kate Thompson, hired in 1894, had spent seven years at Pictou Academy, reaching the third academic level and graduating after spending

37. See “Pictou Academy,” 13 Oct. [1882], PANS, RG14, Vol. 54, No. 71. In 1887, however, a Presbyterian Ladies’ College was established in Halifax. It provided accommodation for female students attending Dalhousie College: see Judith Findlay, “College, Career, and Community: Dalhousie Coeds, 1881-1921,” in *Youth, University and Canadian Society*, 29. The largest rural contingent of women came from eastern Nova Scotia, especially Scottish Presbyterians from Pictou County.
39. “New Pictou Academy,” ibid., Vol. 54, No. 35 (including lithograph). The final cost of the building was $30,000.
two years "in Pianoforte, Harmony and Theory of Music [from] the Music Department."\(^{41}\) She and two other female graduates of Pictou's music programme were continuing students at the New England Conservatory. The Pictou programme was graded in four levels to correspond to those of the New England Conservatory's programme; students who graduated from Pictou could enter the fourth grade of the American programme.

Publicity surrounding this popular non-academic programme emphasized its money-raising potential and its utility (many graduates were supposedly requested as music teachers throughout Nova Scotia).\(^{42}\) In 1897 the music department's annual concert in the new Convocation Hall raised over one hundred dollars, which was used to supplement the Academy's ornithology and other museum collections.\(^{43}\) Not only did the fine arts programme not cost Pictou Academy any money (fees varying from $4 to $10 an hour were charged groups of four, or individual students), but it lent the institution an aura of respectability. Its high culture matched growing middle-class aspirations for higher status; Pictou Town was becoming snobbish.\(^{44}\) In December, 1899, for instance, four students held a garden party, a "social" was held by Mrs. Thomas Young at the end of term, and the Pictou Academy teachers gave a reception to male students after their annual parade around town.\(^{45}\) At the Christmas social in 1898 a vote was taken for the first time on the prettiest girl in the Academy. As they went home Principal Robert Maclellan reminded male students that they should conduct themselves as became "true gentlemen and scholars of Pictou Academy."\(^{46}\)

---

41. Pictou Academy, Pictou, Nova Scotia, *Course of Study For the Year 1894-95* (Pictou: The Advocate, 1894), 16. To underscore their professional qualifications the New England Conservatory masters under whom they were continuing to study were listed in the catalogue.

42. *PA*, 20 July 1894.

43. Ibid., 18 Dec. 1896.

44. When Miss Adela Henderson gave her graduating piano recital in 1912, she was given a series of reviews in the *Pictou Advocate* and two small girls presented her with a beautiful bouquet of roses and carnations: see *PA*, 15 June 1912. Roland Sherwood and several people interviewed mentioned "the smugness" of Pictonians before World War II: see Roland H. Sherwood, "Landing of the Hector," *Nova Scotia Historical Quarterly* 3, 2 (June 1973): 96.

45. *PA*, 8, 15, 22 Dec. 1899. This customary parade began in 1887 during the town's celebration of Queen Victoria's Golden Jubilee.

46. Ibid., 30 Dec. 1898, 7. Over 400 people participated in this event, which included food, decorations, games, and dancing. By 1911 the voting contest had changed from the prettiest to the most popular girl at Pictou Academy; this poll raised over twenty dollars, which was used to purchase a set of dishes for the Academy. The victor was awarded a prize by the committee: see ibid., 4 Mar. 1911.
These social events began to intrude on the studious habits and serious extra-curricular activities which Pictou Academy school authorities had heretofore controlled. When a rink was organized in 1899 the debating society experienced a serious drop-off in its numbers; a letter to the editor of The Pictou Advocate advised male students to make sure they were introduced to young ladies while at the rink. The writer also advised them to profess any interest in astronomy so that they could justify evening walks at the Beaches.\(^47\)

Other expressions of an incipient youthful counter-culture took more serious forms. A large number of students turned out, for instance, for the 1898 debate on “Should women vote”; Miss McRae took the women’s side and was greeted with loud applause when she argued that the vote in women’s hands would “purify” politics.\(^48\) Complaints by students over their heavy workload led to their withdrawal from both the debating society and from the Young Men’s Christian Association.\(^49\) These complaints were part of a heated newspaper debate at this time over the abnormal increase in subjects on the public school curriculum and on the stringency of the teachers’ examinations, both of which cut down the number of male teachers who were winning certification.\(^50\)

Superintendent A.H. MacKay resolved these issues by introducing his New Education reform measures of 1908, which reduced the number of papers required for the high school and the teachers’ examinations. In effect, the “affective discipline” promoted by evangelical Presbyterians and by the politically active maternal feminists at the end of the nineteenth century was changing the social efficiency culture promoted earlier by MacKay and by many of his urban, male colleagues. The long-range effect on the students, however, was to segregate them further into vocational, academic, and later special-education streams, their placement firmly in the hands of the powerful (male) school administrator.

Despite these bureaucratic strategies, however, control of the socialization of adolescents was slipping out of the hands of these middle-class Presbyterian leaders. They began to misconstrue even reasonable attempts by students to govern their own recreational activities. A 1913 request by female students to use the convocation hall to play basketball, in imitation of their male colleagues who began using the YMCA for gymnasium classes beginning in 1911, was denied by the Pictou Academy board, “apparently not caring to have the followers of the young ladies roaming around and through the Academy while waiting for their lady loves to turn from Mars to Venus.”\(^51\) A number of students who

\(^{47}\) Ibid., 13 Jan. 1899; and see ibid., 10 Feb. 1899: the debating club was dwindling because skating held more attraction than either debate meetings or academic studies.

\(^{48}\) Ibid., 23 Dec. 1898.

\(^{49}\) Excerpt in ibid., 27 Jan. 1899.

\(^{50}\) Ibid., 20 Sept. 1895.
commuted by train from the New Glasgow area after 1890, and who were unable to participate in the social culture of the town students because of their train schedule, formed their own group; unwittingly the Academy exacerbated the stratification of lower-class students from their middle-class seatmates. \(^{52}\) School officials at this time attempted to quell the fighting between east and west-end Pictou town students by establishing a consolidated upper-elementary school affiliated with the Academy. But attempts to draw out the talents of individual rural female students, such as Elizabeth Tibbel, who greatly enjoyed the art programme while studying in Grades 10 and 11, did not allay their growing feelings of alienation in the face of the town socialites. \(^{53}\) More assertive students, such as Hazel Corbin (1908-9), who dared to pass a note in class and was briefly expelled for this, left the academic environment in disgust. \(^{54}\)

Through extra-curricular activities, \(^{55}\) through school sports, and through church and school-sponsored social events, school authorities had attempted to construct a cohesive school society and thereby morally temper the side-effects of the excessive competition engendered by the meritocratic programme at Pictou Academy. But the prevailing culture of possessive individualism defeated these efforts. Students recognized that their community rewarded material success and intellectual ability. The debating society stars, such as Dewitt Young, Frank Patterson, and Frank Johnson, were admired by socialite females, such as Jean Ferguson. She easily recalled outstanding classmates, such as Emmaline MacDonald, one of the few females who became lawyers. \(^{56}\) Neither in their inter-

---

51. Ibid., 6 Dec. 1913. As Brian McKillop notes, the introduction of organized sports on Canadian campuses at this time was justified on the grounds that it prepared male students for the harsh world of business, which they were shortly to enter, and dispelled the wimpish, book-work image of the Victorian academic: A.B. McKillop, "Marching as to War: Elements of Ontario Undergraduate Culture, 1880-1914," in *Youth, University and Canadian Society*, 82.

52. Transcript of interview, Mr. James Douglas by Murrin Leim, 1973, Hector Centre, Pictou, OH 16-6.

53. Transcript of interview, Elizabeth Tibbel by Murrin Leim, Pictou, 1977, ibid., OH 23-2. Tibbel had more success with her writing, publishing a number of poems later in *The Pictou Advocate*. When asked whether she had ever shown her poems to the Academy masters, she replied that she never had the courage to do so.

54. Transcript of interview with Jean Ferguson by Hazel, ibid., OH 16-2, 15. Corbin went to New Glasgow, took a business course, earned money by working for the *Evening News*, then went to New York where she trained as a nurse. She became a noted maternity-infant care specialist among wealthy New Yorkers and had two popular books published: *How to be a Mother and How to be a Father*.


56. Interview of Ferguson by Hazel. Patterson and Johnson subsequently became
views nor in their debate topics did the students mention the economic and social dislocations of their region as Pictou County began to experience serious de-industrialization. The competitive individualism stressed by their school culture focused students' attention on their own successful accreditation, or on escapism via their new youth culture.

The First World War brought a change to these trends. As the 1916 centennial of its founding drew nearer, townspeople, local historians, and alumni across the continent began to organize a great celebration to mark the founding of Pictou Academy. Letters poured in as the publicity campaign mounted. Over $8,000 was raised for students' scholarships and bursaries. The two-day celebration featured a parade of tribute to MacKay and Maclellan, the two surviving principals, ceremonies at both Presbyterian churches, and a large convocation of the 500 alumni on the lawn of the Academy grounds to hear speeches by their eminent peers. One of the most significant addresses was delivered by President Stanley MacKenzie of Dalhousie University. He dwelt on the heroic past of Pictou's early Scottish pioneers, who had courageously fought against poverty and educational discrimination by the Anglican establishment. Because of his poverty, the Pictou "lad of parts" worked hard, lost no time, and emerged "a scholar, a thinker and a doer, master of his subject, and with his powers of intellectual industry trained to the fighting point....Self-reliance was the product of industry and of mastery of the subject, and aggressiveness was the dower of the Scot." Reifying the secularism afflicting Presbyterianism, MacKenzie considered schools to be "spiritual and enlightening" temples which led the individual away from the everyday world, "the sordid and ephemeral, [and] drove the imagination to the higher and the beautiful and the real....With higher aspirations and loftier ideals come those spiritual blessings which give character and moral fibre to a people."*59

MacKenzie and his colleagues were constructing a Scottish myth of a virtuous past which all Academy students were to emulate. Personal influence

---

57. See Janet Guildford, "Coping with De-Industrialization: The Nova Scotia Department of Technical Education, 1907-1930," *Acadiensis* 16, 2 (Spring 1987): 69-84. Although A.H. MacKay was instrumental in creating these structural changes at a bureaucratic level and in introducing a New Educational "affective individualism" ethic at the common school and popular level, his meritocratic policies at the secondary school level continued to promote an academic elite.

58. *PA*, 1 Sept. 1916.


and activism, exacerbated by wartime realities, were to be channelled into community service. Activist leaders, such as Frank Parker Day or John W. MacLeod, epitomized this new idealism because of their wartime service and public health campaigns respectively. While the idealism of MacKenzie and his platform colleagues was shared by a world-wide Anglo-Saxon Protestant community and would form part of the philosophy of the social gospel movement and the progressive education movement, the Scottish myth was Pictou's unique construction. Idealism and Scottish mythology would prove to be the twentieth-century moral replacements for Presbyterianism, which throughout the nineteenth century primarily had grounded the socialization efforts of family and school.

Jackson Lears describes this emerging liberal, secularizing culture as a form of antimodernist discontent which avoided the tragic contradictions within capitalistic-Protestant culture by sentimentalizing vitality and social usefulness. Eric Hobsbawm, on the other hand, considers invented tradition to be "a set of practices, normally governed by overtly or tacitly accepted rules and of a ritual or symbolic nature, which seek to inculcate certain values and norms of behaviour by repetition, which automatically implies continuity with the past." The implicit message of Pictou Academy's centenary ceremonies, as far as female alumni were concerned, was that the construction of culture was a return to

61. See Gwendolyn Davies, "Afterword," in Frank Parker Day, Rockbound (Toronto: University of Toronto Press [1928], 1989), 317. And see L.G. "Bud" White, "The History of Pictou County War Memorial," PA, 6 Nov. 1991: George H. Cox, M.D., and John W. MacLeod, Consumption: Its Cause, Prevention, and Cure (London: Eyre and Spottinwode, 1912). MacLeod, a Pictou Academy graduate of 1898, persuaded Lord Strathcona to underwrite the publication costs of the book, 42,000 copies of which were published and distributed free to people in eastern Nova Scotia.


64. Hobsbawm, the Invention of Tradition, 1.
paternalistic control. In a series of acid newspaper letters, a number of female community leaders recounted how their efforts to participate with the executive committee in planning the celebrations had been rebuffed, how the Local Council of Women then conducted its own bursary campaign, how outstanding women graduates of Pictou Academy were ignored, and, finally, how no place on the platform had been given to women. One writer concluded, “One cannot of course expect to find the feminist movement strongly emphasized in a town so deeply entrenched in old-fashioned conservatism as Pictou, but one might have hoped for at least the Scottish-Presbyterian principle of justice.”

While this exchange illustrates how competing interest groups vied for control of the process of defining the emerging Scottish mythology, further events illustrate how the myth was translated into institutional forms. In 1919 the centenary committee incorporated itself as the Pictou Academy Augmentation Fund. Under the dynamic leadership of its secretary, D.A. Cameron, the organization decided to build a boys’ residence in order to “in a new way the ancient link between the Presbyterian body and the Pictou Academy.” The Town of Pictou agreed to donate twenty acres of land on the shore of the harbour for this purpose. The Synod was to nominate the resident master and have a representative on the Board of Trustees. In this way, it was hoped “that the students, while pursuing their studies, may be brought under those moral and religious and social influences which conduce to the development of the highest ideals of life and citizenship.”

Scottish-Presbyterian ideals and cultural symbols were used increasingly by political and religious leaders in Pictou and in Nova Scotia to establish a new sense of community. The Hector celebrations of 1923 and 1973 brought thousands of successful Pictonians home; the publicity “kept alive the high

65. *PA*, 6 Sept. 1916. Subsequent letters supported her viewpoint. See ibid., 22 Sept. 1916. The writer claimed that 2/3 of current enrolment at the Academy was female and that the majority of alumni at the reunion were women.

66. Cameron was a graduate of Pictou Academy and Dalhousie University (1904), where he had been an outstanding football player. In 1919 he was Halifax Manager of the Sun Life Assurance Company.

67. *PA*, 20 Feb. 1920. The name was subsequently changed to the Pictou Academy Educational Foundation, an organization which still exists. In 1923-24 Dr. W.C. Ross was appointed resident master and sports director at the Academy. He became a general proselytizer for the Academy cause throughout the province. Interview, Dr. C.B. Smith, Pictou, 18 June 1986. During World War II the navy took over the residence and it was sold to the government in 1945.

standards of religion and education that characterized the Scots through the long years since the first arrivals in Pictou County." The town's market square was re-named Hector Park and a monument unveiled during the 150th anniversary to the "Landing of the Highlanders." Several years later, led by John A. Stewart from Scotland, Nova Scotia changed its coat of arms back to the original ancient Scottish arms. In reality the schooling culture which Pictonians had constructed had successfully displaced the strong family culture of these Highlanders and it had taught their children the organizing principles of capitalism and modernization, rather than their historical past. Pictonians had learned that a credentializing school system, which they had largely designed, enabled their children to be mobile and to enter the professions and the middle class in large numbers.

The force of the myth in the collective unconscious of these Pictonians, however, can be seen in their 1924-25 overwhelming vote against joining the United Church of Canada. As Keith Clifford writes, their strong defence was not a reactionary act but rather a conserving movement "which had no purpose other than the preservation of the Presbyterian Church in Canada from what was perceived to be an unwarranted attack upon its continued existence." Largely led by elders, such as Pictou's D.A. Cameron and John McKeen, who felt acutely betrayed by their ministers, their actions can be seen as a last-ditch effort by Pictonians to regain control of their community as central Canada took over more and more decision-making power. These strongly individualistic Scottish-Canadians deplored the abandonment of their church for nationalistic ends and refused to be directed or controlled by their ministers, by their theology professors, or by theological bureaucrats. Despite the schooling policies of MacKay, despite their capitalistic tendencies to strive for material success and status, despite the tensions between their affective and social-efficacy forms of discipline, these Pictonians had a strong sense of place and of their historical past. Perhaps their creeping doubts about the promise of a progressive world order after World War

70. Conrad Swan, Canada: Symbols of Sovereignty (Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1977), 124. The ancient arms were reinstated by King George V in January 1929.
72. This paper supports Gwendolyn Davies' assertion that "home place" is "a [Maritime] symbol of cultural continuity and psychological identification in the face of social fragmentation, outmigration, and a continuing hardscrabble economy." At the same time, it argues, like McKay, that cultural construction was constantly occurring and imitated similar trends throughout the western world. See Gwendolyn Davies, Studies in Maritime Literary History, 1760-1930 (Fredericton: Acadia Press, 1991), 194.
I made them more prone to accept idealistic myths about their virtuous Scottish past; constructed history buttressed their family and community relations and helped to quash any residual Calvinistic anxieties.\textsuperscript{73}

As Hobsbawn concludes, invented tradition can be categorized as having three overlapping types: those establishing or symbolizing social cohesion or the membership of groups, those establishing or legitimizing institutions, status, or selections of authority, and those whose main purpose is socialization, the inculcation of beliefs or value systems as “conventions of behaviour.” A.H. MacKay’s bureaucratic reorganization of the school system, supposedly based on a Scottish principle of democratic opportunity for poorer people; the meritocratic practices of Pictou Academy, justified on the Scottish principle of academic excellence; the voluntary extra-curricular activities, especially in natural science, based on the Scottish common-sense providential outlook; and, finally, the centenary celebrations, conducted by eminent male graduates: all were designed to foster not only a community ideal, but also “the corporate sense of superiority of [male] elites.”\textsuperscript{74} In this construction process the Pictou elite demonstrated their considerable success in achieving middle-class cultural hegemony, not only in Pictou County but in the province at large, between 1880 and 1920.

\textsuperscript{73}  See Toby A. Foshay, \textit{J.D. Logan: Canadian Man of Letters} (Hantsport: Lancelot Press, 1982), 19: “Logan [by 1896] has come a considerable distance from the Calvinistic Presbyterianism of his youth. There is neither sin nor the consequent necessity of grace in Logan’s idealism (whereas in Calvinism they are determinate in man’s relation to God). Tension between his newly-developed philosophical views and traditional religious doctrines appear in Logan’s writings...and results in a serious life-crisis in the years 1892-1902.”

\textsuperscript{74}  Hobsbawn, \textit{The Invention of Tradition}, 9 and 10. Italics in original.