

thy subject of research for this definitive and exemplary study.

Ian Ross Robertson
University of Toronto

Paul Green and Nancy Vogan.
Music Education in Canada: A Historical Account. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991. Pp. 544. \$125.00.

Education in music has been an important part of Canadian cultural development since well before Confederation. *Music Education in Canada: A Historical Account*, by Paul Green and Nancy Vogan, traces the development of music education from early instrumental lessons for children to modern post-graduate programmes. Much is revealed about Canadian attitudes towards education in the arts over the years. The book describes the growth of music education from Canada's first days to the centennial in 1967.

I had long awaited the publication of this volume and was eager to read it. Music education in Canada, although discussed on a limited basis, had not up to now been the subject of such a comprehensive review. I was not disappointed.

The authors first discuss music education as it began in each of Canada's four main regions. Second, they discuss later developments, based on the same geographical distinction.

Third, they explore major themes and issues in music education within the national context. Although school music is a primary focus, many other aspects are included, such as private music instruction, teacher training, the role of music education in the community, and even a brief review of events as they have occurred since 1967.

Paul Green, Professor of Music at the University of Western Ontario, and Nancy Vogan, Associate Professor of Music and Education at Mount Allison University, are both well known in musical and educational circles in Canada. There has been considerable speculation over the difficulties involved in gathering data on a national basis and on the difficulties involved in writing such a volume. On the whole, the authors have succeeded admirably. They have also included a number of very interesting photographs of early music groups, including pictures of the Metlakatla Brass Band, Port Simpson, British Columbia, c.1880; the Mount Allison Conservatory Orchestra, Sackville, New Brunswick, 1895; a presentation of Gilbert and Sullivan's *Pirates of Penzance*, Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island, 1910; the Mount Cashel Orphanage Band, St. John's Newfoundland, c.1926; a string class from a convent school in St. John's, Newfoundland, c.1930; the Chorale Notre-Dame-d'Acadie, Moncton, New Brunswick, undated; and a class at l'Université de Montréal under R. Murray Schafer, also undated.

The history of music education in Canada has been affected by the interaction of the church and the com-

munity. This has been especially evident in Quebec, where Roman Catholic institutions have played a dominant role in cultural life. The authors tell about the introduction of music into the public elementary schools of the Montreal Catholic School Commission and trace the development of early texts and curricula.

Music instruction for English-speaking Protestants in Quebec occurred as early as 1789. By 1851 the commissioners of the province and school board in Montreal were employing a music master and instructing the children in singing. Early normal schools and teacher training in Quebec, for both the Catholic and the Protestant system, are examined.

Music education in the Maritimes is then discussed, including the folk traditions of the founding peoples. From fiddle and bagpipe tunes to formalized music instruction in cities such as Halifax and St. John, the reader receives a clear picture of developments. Halifax had a reputation as a city which loved band music during its early days when the British regiments were "stationed at this old seaport" and brought their bands along. The early founding of the Mount Allison Ladies' College in Sackville, New Brunswick and the Mount Allison Wesleyan Academy for Boys are among the many educational institutions which are mentioned.

The Sisters of Charity and the Sisters of the Sacred Heart, two orders established in Halifax in the mid-nineteenth century, were well known for their music. Although it is not possible to detail the many maritime

developments in music, it is interesting to note that the Catholic and Protestant programmes each had their individual characteristics and each had significant outcomes in music education over the years. The amount of data which the authors have accumulated is voluminous. A good deal of this is included in the main text and the rest is available to the interested scholar.

In Ontario, a large number of United Empire Loyalists were joined by a great number of other immigrants around 1800, and they combined to make a life in this rugged area. Conditions were difficult and the finer things of life were possible only for a small minority. This pioneer society, however, did feature music-making by the people. The fact that drinking and gambling were also very prevalent brought about strong reactions from the Church, which had become a central influence in working towards a more permanent and stable society. Church choirs emerged initially, followed later by choral music societies, and instrumental music groups. The latter were encouraged by the British regiments and their bands. Many military personnel who had been skilled in music stayed on in Upper Canada as music teachers, organists, and conductors, adding to the cultural growth of the society. There were those who thought of the fiddle as a "sinful" instrument because of its frequent association with dance music. Although the curricula of the grammar schools of the period were predominantly academic, with much attention paid to the "more fundamental" subjects, music gradually became

a part of public schooling and was included in the education and training of teachers. Vocal music was an essential subject, as proposed earlier by Rousseau and Pestalozzi, and its adoption in European institutions was noted by many Canadians. Music education prospered as a result.

The Methodists were interested in the singing school movement as a means for improving the quality of church singing and as an acceptable social activity. Egerton Ryerson wanted to make music a part of everyday school experience. Recognizing its ability to help foster loyalty and patriotism in Canadian life, he recommended music as a subject in the Common School Act of 1846. Comparison has been made between the arguments for music in the Ontario schools and those in the public schools in the United States. Both cases are said to have been based on mainly extra-musical claims and objectives, such as moral, intellectual, and physical improvement, and better classroom discipline. Also, the idea of music being seen as a break from the so-called "academic" subjects was mentioned. The authors state that "although music managed to gain an initial foothold on the strength of its utilitarian appeal, educators neglected to formulate a convincing rationale that would guarantee the subject any permanent acceptance" (pp. 50-51). Unfortunately, this legacy would haunt the profession for many years to come. The authors show that, as music education in Ontario developed, there was much of which to be proud. They also suggest that there were considerable disputes over methodology, that the

schools suffered from music not always being taught systematically, and that there was a lack of competent music teachers. These complaints have a familiar ring!

The methods controversy went on for many years. A music syllabus was issued by the Ontario Department of Education which outlined two separate courses, one tonic sol-fa and one using staff notation. In 1893 Ottawa discontinued music in the schools and by 1905 recommendations were being made that vocal music be reinstated in Toronto. This was a period of considerable controversy and discussion in Ontario music education.

Part Two deals with the growth, expansion, and role of national institutions. This includes, among others, the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation, the Hart House String Quartet, the Toronto Conservatory of Music, the Canadian College of Organists, the Salvation Army, and the Canadian Bureau for the Advancement of Music. In British Columbia the significant influences of the private teachers, the British Columbia Music Festival, and school music are all described. "The New Canadian Music Course," a five-book series by Coney and Wickett, was authorized for the British Columbia schools in 1925 and advertised as "a graded course of instruction in singing, designed to teach the reading of music, to develop an appreciation of rhythm, and to provide a large selection of songs suitable for all grades." Green and Vogan state that "the song repertoire, use of modulator drills, and the complete outline of theoretical details" reflected the traditional British background of the authors. Although the

series furnished a systematic approach for elementary teachers, in actuality it was neither new nor progressive. Enrolment in music in the British Columbia schools reached a high point in 1929. There was a growing interest in instrumental music and juvenile symphony orchestras "were not uncommon." Music appreciation was also taught.

However, this momentum came to an end in 1931 when financial problems were encountered. Although music continued to be part of the schools in the 1930s, enrolment declined. C.E. Findlater, supervisor of music in Vancouver from 1928 to 1931, taught choral singing at the summer school held in Vancouver and stressed the necessity for theory work in the classroom when teaching music or leading a school choir. Progressive education had not yet begun to affect music as a school subject.

A new group of music educators, however, was on the horizon. In 1936 the music supervisor for Victoria was Stanley Bulley and in 1937 such names as Mildred McManus and Burton Kurth are mentioned. Vancouver had had a series of music supervisors—George Hicks, 1904-19; Fred Dyke, 1920-28; Charles Findlater, 1928-31; Fred Waddington, 1931-37; and Burton Kurth, 1937-55—who were experienced musicians and not necessarily graduates of teaching institutions. Their notions of child development were not necessarily based on the psychology of education as taught in those institutions.

Huge performances were organized by Fred Dyke in 1921 in Stoney Park, on the occasion of the

fiftieth anniversary of the province. It is said that 6,000 children participated! In 1936 Fred Waddington produced a Golden Jubilee programme and his massed choir included 2,000 voices.

Part Three, entitled *New Directions*, deals primarily with such things as *Diversification in the Postwar Years*, *the Evolution of Vocal Programs in the Schools*, *the Rise of Instrumental Music*, *Music in Higher Education*, *the Growth of the Profession*, including material on the *Canadian Federation of Music Teachers' Association*, the *Canadian Music Educators' Association*, and the *Canadian University Music Society*. The problems relevant to teacher training for both generalists and specialists are covered along with a discussion of whether it is better first to develop a musician and then add skills in teaching methods or whether one should first train a teacher and then add musical background in competence. As a solution many Canadian universities offer both types of programmes. An interesting discussion takes place on the merits of concurrent as opposed to consecutive programmes of teacher education. The formation of the *Canadian Association of University Schools of Music* has seemingly had little impact upon many aspects of teacher education in faculties of education in Canada.

Music in graduate education is discussed. In the late 1950s and early 1960s, while attempts were made to appoint qualified teachers to teach music education in Canadian universities, the majority of appointments went to persons who had earned their

master's degrees or doctorates in other countries. Many Canadians were going to the United States and some to Great Britain for such work. This situation continues to this day, although Canadian graduate schools are now producing candidates in graduate music education and the situation has improved.

The growth of the Canadian Music Educators' Association and its development, and the affiliation of the Canadian Music Educators' Association with the International Society for Music Education are described. It is clear as one reads this portion of the volume that much is still left to be done, that we are a profession that is far from completely united. We still need to work towards common purposes and goals.

In the epilogue the authors say "It was difficult to know where to begin a history of music education in Canada. Even after the main strands of activity were identified, it seemed impossible to find well-defined patterns or to connect events which led systematically from the rustic conditions of colonial life to the complex, sophisticated society of an electronic age" (p. 441). I believe that writing this historical account of music education in Canada was an enormous job and I credit Paul Green and Nancy Vogan for doing it. Their organization of the material, the depth of their investigations, and the clarity of their writing all deserve praise.

Green and Vogan have clearly done their homework. The resulting book will certainly be of interest to those who are interested in Canadian music education in the years to come.

Allen E. Clingman
University of British Columbia

Pénélope Caspard-Karydis et André Chambon. *La Presse d'éducation et d'enseignement, 18e s.-1940.* Tome I: A-C, 1981, 560 p., 176 F; Tome II: D-J, 1984, 688 p., 260 F; Tome III: K-R, 1986, 560 p., 210 F; Tome IV, S-Z et suppléments, 1991, 760 p., 350 F; Paris, I.N.R.P./C.N.R.S.

Since the mid-1960s, the history of education has been one of the liveliest areas of research into French history. Sociology students of Pierre Bourdieu and North American historians influenced by the *Annales* school have expanded its compass from pedagogy and politics into the realm of social history with particular emphasis on elites, the economy, family, literacy, religion, and women. The importance of this work is evidenced in the revised *American Historical Association Guide to Historical Literature* (forthcoming, 1993) which devotes a new section to French educational history, in which nineteen of the twenty books listed have been published in the last twenty-five years.

Reacting to this renewed interest in educational history and to its successes, a well-funded research centre, the *Service d'histoire de l'éducation* was installed in the *Institut National de Recherche Pédagogique* in 1977 with a mission to "promote research into the