

of women at Victoria, including the important contributions of alumnae, and then focuses on Margaret Addison, who for many years played a central role as dean of the women's residence and then dean of women. Addison was a strong, if not universally loved, figure; her notions of the proper sort of college education for Methodist women occasionally brought her into conflict not only with the men, like Nathanael Burwash, who ran Victoria, but also with other equally strong-minded Methodist women who were involved in residence management and other matters.

It is always difficult to assess the impact of students' educational experiences on their lives. Selles is well aware of this challenge but has limited success in meeting it, though she provides interesting detail on the subsequent careers of Victoria women. As well, though an analysis of Methodist education for men lies beyond the scope of this account, it is clearly essential for a full understanding of the gendered nature of that experience. Nevertheless, as a comprehensive survey of Methodist schooling for women in Ontario, this book, with its helpful bibliography, makes a useful contribution to an important subject. It will prove both interesting and rewarding for all those who want to know more about the interplay of the histories of women, education, and religion in Ontario, and indeed beyond.

W. P. J. Millar
London, Ontario

Phillip McCann. *Schooling in a Fishing Society: Education and Economic Conditions in Newfoundland and Labrador, 1836–1986*. St. John's, Nfld.: Institute for Social and Economic Research, Memorial University of Newfoundland, 1994. Pp. 277.

Newfoundland has long been regarded as the poor sister of Confederation. For many decades its thinly scattered outport population has, without conspicuous success, sought to confront the vagaries of the North Atlantic fishery while begrudgingly acquiescing in various resettlement and welfare schemes. A century ago well over two-thirds of the Newfoundland economy was based on the fishery; today well over two-thirds of it is devoted to the service sector. The fishery, nevertheless, continues to dominate the collective psyche of the Newfoundland people and most coastal Newfoundlanders think it inconceivable that fishing will cease to be the dominant force in their lives and livelihood. Foreign trawlers will be subdued; the cod stocks will return; normality will be restored.

Just as ordinary Newfoundlanders have dealt with the anxiety and dislocation attendant to the collapse of the fishery in the 1990s, scholars and policy analysts have sought to take the measure of the calamity and assess what it means for the future. Always in these considerations the question of how many people the province can sustain arises (long before “downturn economists” such as Parcival Copes had argued that Newfoundland’s population should be reduced by about half) and what must be done to achieve the optimum level. There is at times interest in retrospective analysis—if not outright scapegoating—to assign blame for the province’s miserable economic condition.

The denominational school system has often been a favourite target. For example, in a blistering speech to the legislature nearly twenty years ago reported by his biographer, Clare Hoy, former premier Clyde Wells condemned the denominational school system for denying young Newfoundlanders reasonable economic opportunities (“I do not want to be the one who tells this to the boy from Port au Choix or the girl from White Bay South . . . we protected your religious rights, but unfortunately you are condemned forever to washing dishes in a restaurant because that is all you are qualified to do”). In the more recent past, William McKim’s influential book, *The Vexed Question: Denominational Education in a Secular Age*, exposed several of the Newfoundland school system’s weaknesses—such as the expensive duplication of services and woefully inadequate achievement results—and revealed, perhaps for the first time, the full extent of the public’s willingness to support major changes. The criticisms advanced in this source were taken up by the Williams Commission in the early part of this decade and out of its investigations came the current reforms (including a controversial constitutional amendment) that promise to relegate denominational concerns to the very fringe of most major policy deliberations.

Phillip McCann’s new contribution to the apparently never-ending supply of deeply introspective investigations of Newfoundland’s school system is designed to shed light on economic conditions and in a limited way assess to what extent the woeful educational deficiencies of the past may have been a consequence of those conditions. It is in large measure an exercise in history of the “what if?” variety, quite unlike anything he has done before. The book is dense with tables painstakingly put together from a wide variety of primary sources. In sum they reveal a host of relationships between and among the various denominational school systems and in turn relate several of the outcomes of these systems to selected measures of economic performance. (There are 72 tables in a double-spaced text of about 250 pages; for the most part these are derived from an additional 193 tables published in a companion volume under the same general title but with a different subheading—the

second volume was not supplied to the reviewer.) The reader will find an abundance of information on school enrolments, attendance, student achievement, the curriculum, salaries of teachers, and so forth, and much of this information is in turn further classified by denomination, by region, and by gender.

In by far the most interesting section of the book, McCann shows how attendance rates varied inversely with a key measure of economic productivity and how the effectiveness of the individual denominations in achieving scholastic results was closely tied to the economic well-being of the areas in which they operated schools. No surprises here, but nevertheless an interesting and richly detailed exposition of the relationship between schooling and the economy is provided. Also useful is McCann's critique of David Alexander's well-known attempt to gauge the quality of labour in the nineteenth century by assessing literacy rates, and from that to project what costs would have been entailed to yield results with a salutary effect on the economy. McCann's preference is to assess as best as one possibly can the quality of schooling and scholastic achievement and then to calculate the cost of making an acceptable quality of schooling available on a universal basis. Like Alexander, he concludes that a much higher level of expenditure was possible but he is slightly less confident of the economic effects of such a commitment to schooling.

In his own brilliant essay in McKim's *Vexed Question*, McCann argued that only a careful explication of the ideology and social structure of Newfoundland's merchant elite (Sid Noel's fabled "fishocracy") could show why the denominational system developed as it did, and further, that the effects of that system could not be known without a detailed analysis of the quality and quantity of schooling. *Schooling in a Fishing Society* was written partly to meet the latter requirement. It remains to wed quantitative and qualitative approaches in order to provide a clearer understanding than we now have of why Newfoundland stuck with an approach to education that in many, if not most respects impeded economic modernization. One of the keys to this understanding is determining how the denominational principle was extended to all facets of political and administrative life as well as to schooling (a matter of interesting and suggestive comment in sources as diverse as Richard Gwyn's biography of Joseph Smallwood and Sid Noel's celebrated history of Newfoundland politics), and the effects of that extension on public attitudes and expectations. Anyone who has examined the personal memoirs and reflections on Newfoundland schools and society by such "come-from-aways" as Claire Mowat and Don Sawyer cannot help but be struck by how closely the schools embody, indeed cleave to the communities of which they are a part. A proper understanding of the Newfoundlander's traditional loyalty to denom-

inational schooling and the effects of that schooling on society will require that the relative effects of each be somehow sorted out.

All of which is to suggest, somewhat in the fashion of David Tyack's memorable essay on various explanations for the development of compulsory school attendance legislation in the United States, that much more than the fine-tuning of a singular approach is required to establish a clear understanding of how denominational schooling retained a long-term grip on the people of Newfoundland. In Tyack's words: "entertaining explicit alternative models and probing their value assumptions may help historians to gain a more complex and accurate perception of the past and a greater awareness of the ambiguous relationship between outcome and intent." For Newfoundland's educational experience those alternative models rest in the cultural, political, psychological, sociological, and even spiritual domains of knowledge, as well as in the realm of economic explanation. Phillip McCann makes no claim that his study is definitive history or a "treatise" on economic development. He is unquestionably in the best position of any scholar to integrate the data reported in this volume with other perspectives on the history of Newfoundland's school system. Out of such a synthesis could emerge the most comprehensive portrait of a provincial education system ever attempted. It is a task one hopes he will undertake.

Eric W. Ricker
Dalhousie University

Thérèse Hamel. *Un siècle de formation des maîtres au Québec, 1836–1939*. Ville la Salle: Éditions Hurtubise, 1995. Pp. 374. \$34.50.

Au milieu du 19^{ème} siècle, à la plupart des jeunes qui voulaient devenir maîtres d'écoles, les autorités scolaires du Canada Est commencèrent à demander un certificat de bonne conduite et elles les enjoignirent de se présenter à l'un des trois "Bureaux d'examineurs" de la province, créés en 1841, pour écrire, dans le cas du niveau primaire, une courte dictée et calculer une simple équation. La plupart se rendirent au nouvel exercice, à l'exception d'un cinquième des instituteurs qui continuèrent d'être embauchés par les commissaires d'écoles comme autrefois, sans certificat de qualification formelle, instituteurs venus des couvents et des séminaires qui bénéficièrent longtemps d'une exemption à la règle, des jeunes—des garçons pour les deux-tiers—qui choisirent de fréquenter l'une des trois écoles normales d'État fondées en 1857. La faible proportion des maîtres bénéficiant de cette formation professionnelle n'était pas propre aux francophones catholiques: l'École