

Par surcroît, des origines sociales diverses—noblesse, bureaucratie civile et militaire, clergé, professions libérales et monde des affaires—ne facilitent pas l'homogénéité du groupe. Plus important encore, soutient Ruane, l'unanimité est loin d'exister, au sein du mouvement enseignant, quant à la place à accorder à la femme-enseignante. Tant à l'intérieur de la salle de classe que de la profession, les femmes sont victimes de mesures discriminatoires; néanmoins, elles développent leur propre identité en tant qu'enseignantes et elles luttent afin d'obtenir une juste place à l'intérieur de leur organisation professionnelle, dominée par des hommes qui acceptent mal que leur autorité soit contestée de l'intérieur et qui tentent de les confiner à la périphérie de la profession. Finalement, les enseignants sont divisés quant au but de leur mission: doivent-ils être, dans la tradition du populisme russe, des serviteurs du peuple ou des professionnels, poursuivant leurs propres intérêts politiques et économiques? Division intéressante parce qu'elle soulève les problèmes de hiérarchie et d'égalité à l'intérieur de la société, mais qui risque de créer—dans la mesure où les deux concepts ne sont pas nécessairement incompatibles—une fausse dichotomie entre égalitarisme et professionalismisme.

Fruit d'une recherche approfondie et raisonnablement bien écrit, ce livre intéressera à la fois historiens, éducateurs, administrateurs scolaires et spécialistes des études des femmes. De plus, il ajoute une pierre à l'édifice, déjà imposant (Seregny, Hutchinson, Eklof, Kassow, Balzer, Wortman, Fuller et Sanders), d'études consacrées au développement des professions en Russie dans les dernières décades de l'ère tsariste.

J.-Guy Lalande
St. Francis Xavier University

Sharon Anne Cook, *"Through Sunshine and Shadow": The Woman's Christian Temperance Union, Evangelicalism, and Reform in Ontario, 1874–1930*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1995. Pp. xi, 281. Can\$39.95 cloth.

"Through Sunshine and Shadow" is an interesting case study of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union (WCTU) in Ontario over sixty years. Unlike previous WCTU studies in Canada, this one is a complete monograph (as opposed to individual articles), looks at the provincial WCTU organization with the largest membership and over many decades, and uses evangelicalism as the context for understanding the organization, its successes, and its failures. Other studies have been restricted—to Saskatchewan (McGovern), to Alberta, Saskatchewan, and, in a more limited way, Nova Scotia (Sheehan)—

and have emphasized education. Mitchenson's work, on the other hand, dealt with the Dominion organization in the nineteenth century, particularly its leadership and organization. *"Through Sunshine and Shadow"* builds on these earlier studies and extends and deepens our knowledge of women's organizations, evangelicalism and social change in Ontario. It emphasizes local WCTU records, as well as Ontario and Dominion records, comparing the WCTU to other women's and temperance organizations. It considers Ontario alongside the National (U.S.) and World WCTUs, examines the ideas undergirding their beliefs, and describes the strategies used to put into practice these beliefs.

Cook's monograph delves into the origins and growth of the temperance movement in the United States and Britain, seeing the Ontario WCTU in the perspective of the Women's Crusade, the Chautauqua Movement, Temperance Lodges, Sunday Schools, and Bands of Hope. Generally the temperance movement was led by evangelical reformers and targeted the working classes. The formation of the National WCTU resulted from growing realization of the evils of alcohol. Borrowing from the Women's Crusades, the WCTU organized itself as a non-political, non-sectarian network whose goal was to change public attitudes toward alcohol. Cook uses her historical enquiries into the American, British, and World WCTUs to help explain the beginnings of the Ontario WCTU, meanwhile successfully integrating discussions of national and world leaders, strategies, and ideas.

The author examines the Ontario organization's structure over time, and its relationship to other organizations. Although the study spans the period 1874–1930, Cook argues that the nineteenth century was the heyday of WCTU influence, and that the twentieth century saw a decline. Yet prohibition, the extension of the franchise, and other social reforms important to the temperance crusade, did not occur until the second decade of the twentieth century. Her explanation is that the WCTU did not advocate political change, but worked to influence behaviour. In this respect the Ontario WCTU differed from western organizations, particularly those in Alberta and Saskatchewan, where political work had priority, and where legislative victory called for celebration. Cook suggests the movement for legislative change in Ontario was male-dominated, led by the Temperance Lodges. My research on the Prairies, especially in Alberta, suggests the WCTU was much more active and organized than the male organizations. Whether this had something to do with the leadership in Alberta, with the origins of the WCTU locals formed after the turn of the century, or with patterns of immigration and settlement, it does invite further and comparative study. The Person's Case, which originated in Alberta, was led by five strong women, all of whom had taken leadership positions in either the WCTU or other women's groups, and who supported

social reform. This may suggest that Ontario and Prairie women viewed their roles quite differently.

"Through Sunshine and Shadow" carefully surveys the relation between the Ontario WCTU on one hand, and the American and World organizations on the other. It deals jointly with the provincial WCTU organization and the Dominion one, and with the WCTU in Ontario vis-à-vis similar reform organizations. These comparisons are informative, give the Ontario WCTU some "flesh," particularly when Cook stresses differences in ideology or practice, and offer the reader insight into social and organizational relationships in Ontario. These comparisons pay no attention, however, to provincial WCTU organizations elsewhere in Canada. If Alberta, with its more militant approach, is any indication, they may have varied considerably.

Cook identifies ideas that provided the WCTU with values and principles for action. These included ideas about the family, alcohol, social purity, woman's suffrage, nationalism, imperialism, peace, race and ethnicity, and evangelicalism; they give the reader an understanding of WCTU beliefs in the changing Ontario of the turn of the century. The WCTU outlook was not entirely consistent. Ideas about the family, for example, invited a different approach to husbands as contrasted with sons and to daughters as opposed to sons. The impossible role espoused for women—to influence sons through long hours in conversation—is in contrast to that for husbands, who are invisible in the WCTU literature—unless victims of drink. On the other hand, daughters were organized into YWCTUs (Young Women's Christian Temperance Unions), providing them with the philosophy and practice to become examples of ideal womanhood.

The idea undergirding all of the WCTU's work was the protection of the family. WCTU members have been identified by twentieth-century historians as maternal feminists, women who saw society as their family and had a major role to play in protecting it. Thus ideas on alcohol, on social purity, on peace, on women's suffrage, and so forth were within the jurisdiction of the WCTU since society should provide an ideal bulwark for the family.

The other "idea" presented by Cook, evangelicalism, needs further explanation. Evangelicalism was the basis in the early years of the WCTU in the United States and Ontario. Cook argues that by 1910 the leadership in Ontario and the Dominion was no longer evangelical, but that evangelicalism continued in the local unions in towns and rural areas. Like the argument on militancy in other parts of the country, I believe this would benefit from comparative study.

"Through Sunshine and Shadow" documents the strategies, including the formation of the YWCTU, used throughout WCTU history. Departments of work were many, local unions could decide which to emphasize, and these

changed according to member interests, locale, and opportunities. The WCTU believed education was its most important strategy and used various strategies to get its message out. Scientific Temperance Instruction was the name of the department whose role was to achieve a temperance curriculum, complete with textbooks, visual aids, and a provincial examination for the public schools. Members approached teachers and principals at the local school level. George Ross, premier and minister of education in Ontario, is quoted as saying WCTU means "Women Constantly Troubling Us." Although Cook captures eloquently the WCTU's difficulties with their education campaign, she has not examined carefully the textbooks and the messages the WCTU advocated. From the point of view of teachers, these clearly would not have been acceptable learning materials. They used arcane, medical language, described great harm to the body from even one drink, and required memorization without understanding. Other educational strategies—essay and poster contests, receptions for teachers, and the Loyal Temperance Legion—met with a limited response. As Cook notes, the WCTU was sometimes in despair over its lack of progress in this aspect of its work.

There were other strategies, too numerous to mention here. The author spends time defending the Ontario WCTU against charges that it was racist. Her argument that we must look at the organization in its own time and not judge it by today's "political correctness" standards are well founded. And yet I think it is almost a case of "one doth protest too much." Earlier WCTU studies include comments from the leadership of Dominion, Alberta, and Saskatchewan WCTUs and from superintendents of the Work Among Foreigners Department which show a distaste for foreigners and for the work required to assimilate them. Perhaps the heavier immigration from Eastern Europe to the Prairies accounts for a less-than-charitable view of Canadians not of western European descent on the Prairies.

Although Cook has difficulty achieving objectivity and shows a sympathetic, sometimes non-critical approach, *"Through Sunshine and Shadow"* is a thoughtful examination of the Ontario WCTU. For scholars interested in evangelicalism, social reform, and temperance it is a "must-read." It deftly places the Ontario WCTU in the larger world of the Dominion, National, and World organizations, and in the grass-roots social-change movement of the late nineteenth/early twentieth centuries. I have a few quibbles with Cook's interpretation of my own work but they are not serious and could perhaps be discussed sometime with a drink in hand! I recommend this volume with enthusiasm.

Nancy Sheehan
University of British Columbia